



CITY OF FORT PIERCE

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

REBECCA GROHALL, AICP, PLANNING AND FPRA DIRECTOR
COMPREHENSIVE PLANNING ♦ DEVELOPMENT REVIEW
HISTORIC PRESERVATION ♦ URBAN DESIGN ♦ ZONING

AUGUST 22, 2016/
SEPTEMBER 26/2016

COA 16-43

Owner

St. Andrews Episcopal

Applicant

J.A. Taylor Roofing, Inc.

Location

210 S Indian River Drive

Parcel

2410-510-0007-000-0

Historic Status

Non-contributing Structure located in the Downtown Historic District.

Requested Action

Consideration of an approval for the replacement of the existing shingle roof with Standing Seam Aluminum Roof Panel System.

Recommendation

Denial

Staff

Maria Lewicka, AICP
Historic Preservation Planner

Kori Benton
Senior Planner

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD : PUBLIC HEARING



Location Map



Contributing



Non-Contributing



Subject Site

STAFF ANALYSIS

History

St. Andrew's Episcopal Church, founded in 1893, is proud to be located in historic downtown Fort Pierce with its rich past. Many of Fort Pierce's founding fathers were members of St. Andrew's. In 1901, the year of Fort Pierce's incorporation, the Episcopal community of the area constructed their first church building, a "Carpenter's Gothic" structure originally located on Pine Street. In 1917 the church building was physically relocated to the current St. Andre's site adjacent to the Indian River. The structure remained a beloved house of worship until construction of the current Sanctuary in 1959. The original church building was moved a second time, as a gift from St. Andrew's to Holy Apostle's, a mission in Satellite Beach, Florida. The stained glass windows, donated as memorials through the years, were retained and re-mounted in the rear of the present Sanctuary (ref: www.mystandrews.org).



Aerial View of the Church and School Site



South Indian River Drive Elevation

Request

The applicant is requesting consideration for approval for replacement of the existing Sanctuary roof including removal of existing fiberglass shingles, repair and re-nailing of the deck and installation of a one inch (1") Standing Seam Aluminum Roof Panel System in "Terra Cotta" color over self-adhered underlayment.



Terra Cotta NEW
R 34.8 • E.89 • SRI 37.9

Secretary of Interior Standards for Consideration

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alternations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in a such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.



View of the Church and School Site

Staff Analysis

The Sanctuary's gable roof remains a principal architectural element of the building that creates its character and special visual quality. Further, it blends well with the other buildings on the St. Andrew's campus. Therefore choosing a roof material that is of a complimentary texture, color and style is essential to maintaining the overall character of the building, as well as continuity with the surrounding campus and neighborhood structures. The selection of an Aluminum Standing Seam System represents an incompatible aesthetic which does not assimilate well with the architectures of the St. Andrews campus buildings, would not be in harmony with the overall character of the downtown area featuring a variety of shingle and tile roofs, and would also represent a conflict with the Secretary of the Interior Standards



School and Church buildings



Staff Recommendation

The request for the consideration of an approval for the replacement of the existing shingle roof with Standing Seam Aluminum Roof Panel System presents conflicts with the architectural and historical aesthetics of the downtown Historical District as well as the Secretary of the Interior Standards. Therefore, staff recommends that the Historical Review Board deny this application for Certificate of Appropriateness or, consider approval contingent on submission and approval of an alternative roofing material compatible in architectural texture, style and appearance to the surrounding structures and Historic District.

Historic Preservation Board Review

August 22, 2016

- The Board decision was postponed pending additional information/documents from the applicant.

September 15, 2016

- The applicant provided a draft of Resolution with the agreement of the Vestry of St. Andrew's Episcopal Church to replace all remaining roofs on Church-owned buildings with the same material style, design, and color as the sanctuary roof" (attached).

