

FP #2016-028 Auditing Services Evaluation Sheet

	Berger, Toombs, Elam, Gaines & Frank					Berman, Hopkins, Wright & Laham					Carr, Rigg & Ingram							
Mandatory Requirements Met a. Licensed in the State b. Conflict of Interest Disclosure c. Adherence to Submittal Instructions d. Copy of Most Recent External Quality Control Review No Points Awarded/Yes or No	Yes	Member	Member	Member	Member	Member	Yes	Member	Member	Member	Member	Member	Yes	Member	Member	Member	Member	Member
		1	2	3	4	5		1	2	3	4	5		1	2	3	4	5
Past Experience and Performance on Comparable Government Engagements Total Possible 30pts	126	25	30	20	23	28	108	20	20	20	23	25	113	20	20	20	23	30
Quality Personnel Qualifications Total Possible 10pts	43	10	10	10	8	5	46	10	10	10	8	8	47	10	10	10	7	10
Adequacy of Proposed Staffing Plan Total Possible 20pts	91	15	18	20	20	18	51	10	12	4	15	10	53	15	12	6	15	5
Adequacy of Sampling Techniques Total Possible 5pts	25	5	5	5	5	5	25	5	5	5	5	5	25	5	5	5	5	5
Adequacy of Analytical Procedures Total Possible 5pts	22	5	4	5	5	3	24	5	4	5	5	5	24	5	4	5	5	5
Price Total Possible 30pts	60	12	12	12	12	12	150	30	30	30	30	30	105	21	21	21	21	21
Locality Total Possible 30pts	150	30	30	30	30	30	50	10	10	10	10	10	50	10	10	10	10	10
Total Possible 130 Points	517	102	109	102	103	101	454	90	91	84	96	93	417	86	82	77	86	86

FP #2016-028 Auditing Services Evaluation Sheet

	Cherry, Bekaert, & Holland					Dibartolomeo, McBee, Hartley, & Barnes					EFPR Group							
Mandatory Requirements Met a. Licensed in the State b. Conflict of Interest Disclosure c. Adherence to Submittal Instructions d. Copy of Most Recent External Quality Control Review No Points Awarded/Yes or No	Yes	M e m b e r 1	M e m b e r 2	M e m b e r 3	M e m b e r 4	M e m b e r 5	Yes	M e m b e r 1	M e m b e r 2	M e m b e r 3	M e m b e r 4	M e m b e r 5	Yes	M e m b e r 1	M e m b e r 2	M e m b e r 3	M e m b e r 4	M e m b e r 5
Past Experience and Performance on Comparable Government Engagements Total Possible 30pts	130	25	30	20	25	30	140	30	30	20	30	30	105	15	20	20	25	25
Quality Personnel Qualifications Total Possible 10pts	49	10	10	10	9	10	48	10	10	10	8	10	48	10	10	10	8	10
Adequacy of Proposed Staffing Plan Total Possible 20pts	73	15	13	16	19	10	94	20	18	18	20	18	69	10	13	12	19	15
Adequacy of Sampling Techniques Total Possible 5pts	25	5	5	5	5	5	25	5	5	5	5	5	25	5	5	5	5	5
Adequacy of Analytical Procedures Total Possible 5pts	25	5	5	5	5	5	25	5	5	5	5	5	21	5	4	5	5	2
Price Total Possible 30pts	30	6	6	6	6	6	45	9	9	9	9	9	90	18	18	18	18	18
Locality Total Possible 30pts	50	10	10	10	10	10	150	30	30	30	30	30	50	10	10	10	10	10
Total Possible 130 Points	382	76	79	72	79	76	527	109	107	97	107	107	408	73	80	80	90	85

FP #2016-028 Auditing Services Evaluation Sheet

	Keefe McCullough					Mauldin & Jenkins					Moore Stephens Lovelace							
Mandatory Requirements Met a. Licensed in the State b. Conflict of Interest Disclosure c. Adherence to Submittal Instructions d. Copy of Most Recent External Quality Control Review No Points Awarded/Yes or No	Yes	M e m b e r 1	M e m b e r 2	M e m b e r 3	M e m b e r 4	M e m b e r 5	Yes	M e m b e r 1	M e m b e r 2	M e m b e r 3	M e m b e r 4	M e m b e r 5	Yes	M e m b e r 1	M e m b e r 2	M e m b e r 3	M e m b e r 4	M e m b e r 5
Past Experience and Performance on Comparable Government Engagements Total Possible 30pts	108	20	20	20	28	20	100	20	25	20	25	10	135	30	30	20	30	25
Quality Personnel Qualifications Total Possible 10pts	48	10	10	10	8	10	48	10	10	10	8	10	48	10	10	10	8	10
Adequacy of Proposed Staffing Plan Total Possible 20pts	72	10	13	14	19	16	68	20	13	8	17	10	75	20	13	10	17	15
Adequacy of Sampling Techniques Total Possible 5pts	23	5	5	5	5	3	25	5	5	5	5	5	25	5	5	5	5	5
Adequacy of Analytical Procedures Total Possible 5pts	23	5	5	5	5	3	25	5	5	5	5	5	25	5	5	5	5	5
Price Total Possible 30pts	120	24	24	24	24	24	135	27	27	27	27	27	75	15	15	15	15	15
Locality Total Possible 30pts	50	10	10	10	10	10	50	10	10	10	10	10	50	10	10	10	10	10
Total Possible 130 Points	444	84	87	88	99	86	451	97	95	85	97	77	433	95	88	75	90	85

RFP #2016-028 Auditing Services Evaluation Sheet- Price

	Berger, Toombs, Elam, Gaines & Frank	Berman, Hopkins, Wright & Laham	Carr, Riggs & Ingram	Cherry Bekaert	Dibartolomeo, McBee, Hartley, & Barnes	EFPR Group	Keefe McCullough	Mauldin & Jenkins	MooreStephens Lovelace
Year 1	106,000	92,000	98,000	111,000	105,000	99,450	94,500	90,000	100,000
Year 2	108,000	92,000	98,000	113,800	108,000	99,450	96,500	92,500	100,000
Year 3	109,500	92,000	99,600	116,645	111,000	99,450	98,500	95,000	102,500
Total	323,500	276,000	295,600	341,445	324,000	298,350	289,500	277,500	302,500