

**DRAFT MINUTES**

**CITY OF GLENDALE  
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
MUNICIPAL OFFICE COMPLEX  
CONFERENCE ROOM B-2  
5850 W. GLENDALE AVENUE  
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301  
JANUARY 23, 2020  
6:30 p.m.**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Dorlisa Dvorak, Chair  
Lisa Baker, Vice Chair  
Elida Feltus  
Kirstin Flores  
David Giles  
Theodora Hackenberg  
Marcia Hopp-Newman  
Vivian Lizarraga  
Leslee Miele  
Alicia Rubio  
Lynda Vescio

MEMBERS ABSENT: Tim Wayne

STAFF PRESENT: Matthew Hess, Community Revitalization Administrator  
Trilese DiLeo, Revitalization  
Tim Barnard, Assistant Director, Public Facilities and Special  
Events  
Karen Dash, Karen Dash Consulting (via conference call)

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Dvorak called the meeting to order at 6:32 p.m.

**2. ROLL CALL**

Chair Dvorak facilitated roll call. Committee-members introduced themselves.

**3. CITIZEN COMMENTS**

None. No citizens were present.

**4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES**

**Motion by Committee-member Flores, second by Committee-member Hackenberg, to approve the January 8, 2020 and January 9, 2020 CDAC meeting minutes with the change of “Kristin Flores” to “Kirstin Flores”. The motion carried 10 – 0. [Committee-member Rubio was not yet present.]**

**5. OLD BUSINESS**

None.

**6. NEW BUSINESS**

a. Consolidated Plan Data Analysis and Preliminary Goals

[Committee-member Rubio entered the meeting during this agenda item.]

Mr. Hess provided background on the Consolidated Plan (Con Plan), which serves as a community needs assessment and provides data on current conditions in the City as well as the needs of vulnerable populations such as seniors, youth, and the homeless. Mr. Hess announced that the Con Plan will be presented to Council at their February 11, 2020 Workshop. Mr. Hess introduced Ms. Dash, who was the consultant hired to conduct research, analyze the data, and undertake the public participation process. Ms. Dash gave a presentation, which included the following information:

2020-2024 HUD Consolidated Plan

- The Consolidated Planning Process
  - Element I: Background Research/Environmental Scan - Completed
  - Element II: Citizen Participation Process - Completed
  - Element III: Data Analysis – In progress
  - Element IV: Develop HUD Documents – In progress
    - Draft Con Plan and Annual Action Plan for public review and comment from April 3 to May 4 (30-day comment period)
    - Present results to City Council
    - Finalize Con Plan and Annual Action Plan
  - Final: Submit Plans to HUD
- A Community Based Plan
  - Our Plan has been strengthened by the participation of Glendale’s citizens and residents
  - Survey in English and Spanish; available on the City’s website, email blast, paper copies and more.
  - 8 Public Hearings throughout the City
  - 462 Community Surveys received back: 450 in English and 12 in Spanish
  - City Council and CDAC Priority Setting Meetings
  - 1 City Council Funding Presentation
  - 2 CDAC Funding Presentations
  - Family Resource Fair
  - Glendale Chamber of Commerce Presentation
  - 11 interviews with key partners/stakeholders in government, non-profit, business, and faith communities
  - City Council Workshop and Voting meetings
- Representative Comments from Key Stakeholder Interviews
  - A sampling of feedback comments was shared.
- Perceived Barriers to Affordable Housing
  - Cost of land or lot
  - Not in My Back Yard (NIMBY) mentality
  - Cost of labor
  - Cost of materials
  - Lack of affordable housing development policies
  - Lack of available land
- Glendale: Key Needs Data
  - 2019 Glendale median home price: \$255,000

- Over 900 Glendale school children are homeless
- Other pertinent statistics were presented.
- Summary of Public Priorities
  - Surveys, interviews, and public meeting feedback addressed four priority needs:
    - Affordable Housing
    - Housing and Services for Homeless People and Those at Risk of Homelessness
    - Services and Facilities, particularly for Severely Mentally Ill People, Veterans, and Children Aging out of the Foster Care System.
    - Employment and Job Training Services
- Proposed Goals based on Public Feedback and Data Analysis
  - Community feedback and environmental scan research suggests the focus on the following goals:
    - Increasing the supply of clean, decent, affordable housing, including new rental and home ownership units, replacement housing, repairs to low-income and senior housing
    - Increasing access to housing and services for homeless people and those at risk of homelessness
    - Increasing services for special populations, particularly severely mentally ill people, veterans, and children aging out of the Foster Care System
    - Increasing job training and employment assistance programs
    - Affirmatively further Fair Housing

Ms. Dash concluded her presentation and opened the floor for questions or comments.

Committee-member Hackenberg asked if the future goals varied from past goals. Ms. Dash did not believe there was much variance. Mr. Hess relayed that there are a lot of goals, but the priority goals are much more focused, were heard over and over again, and thus rose to the top. Mr. Hess noted that even from a business owner's perspective, affordable housing and homelessness were priorities.

Chair Dvorak commented on the need for more higher paying jobs in Glendale.

Vice Chair Baker agreed and added that the City still needs affordable housing for those in service worker positions as they are still necessary jobs for the City. Vice Chair Baker stressed that people need to be able to live in the City that they work, housing prices are increasing nationally, every city is dealing with the loss of affordable housing, and affordable housing needs to be high quality.

Committee-member Rubio commented that the Committee needs to look at what else it can use CDBG funds for such as economic development programs and workforce development programs. Committee-member Rubio agreed that higher paying jobs in the lower income census tracts were needed.

Chair Dvorak commented on the need for skilled trades jobs and education for such. Chair Dvorak noted the affordable housing complex that the Committee supported last year.

Committee-member Miele's comments included the following:

- Most of a beginning teacher's paycheck goes toward rent and some work two or three jobs.
- There needs to be more housing options.

- Enrollment is declining in the school district in the downtown neighborhoods because families cannot afford to live in the area.
- Rents are being raised to astronomical levels.
- Even people in professional jobs are doubling up in housing.

Committee-member Vescio stressed the need for more housing options as there is only so much land in the City.

Committee-member Giles stated that another driver in housing costs are people moving into the City and outbidding others for homes. Vice Chair Baker agreed and noted that investors are driving up rent prices.

Committee-member Vescio commented that the goal should be to help the maximum number of people which may mean only apartments instead of single family homes. She stated that affordable housing should be open to all, not just special populations and all citizens should have access to affordable housing. Mr. Hess clarified that the special population context relates more to services.

Committee-member Rubio recommended more focus and education on environmental justice and sustainability. Committee-member Rubio recalled another Committee-member's comments at a previous meeting regarding residents living next to a factory. Committee-member Rubio would like to see a multi-family complex next to City Hall.

Committee-member Giles recalled when Hickman's farms used to be located in Glendale, but moved due to complaints from residents.

Committee-member Rubio stressed the need for more federal funds in low-income areas, which are sometimes overlooked. Committee-member Rubio suggested including the term "healthy neighborhoods" in the Con Plan.

Vice Chair Baker suggested the term "clean, decent affordable housing" to the Plan.

Mr. Hess stated there was a place for environmental justice in the Plan and suggested a sub-category under the goals.

Committee-member Rubio commented that the Plan needs to be solid, all-encompassing, and needs to serve as a mechanism for potential partnership.

Mr. Hess announced the Con Plan will be presented to Council on February 11<sup>th</sup> and Ms. Dash will join in the presentation.

The agenda item was concluded.

#### b. Final CDAC Funding Recommendations for FY2020-21

The Committee-members reviewed their CDBG preliminary funding recommendations for FY2020-21 from their January 9<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> recommendation meetings.

Vice Chair Baker asked if the City would hire a Homeless Navigator with the Public Service set aside. Mr. Hess explained the City would not hire an individual internally, but would put out an RFP for those services if directed by Council. Vice Chair Baker asked if the same amount of funding would be set aside each year or if funding would come from the General Fund at some time. Mr. Hess could not confirm what would occur in the future. Mr. Hess announced staff will be meeting this week to discuss the possibility of expanding the Glendale Works Program.

Committee-member Miele expressed concern about losing the momentum of the Community Bridges Housing Navigator and noted that she has seen the Navigator in the streets and establishing relationships with people. Committee-member Miele stated that an RFP could take a long time and Community Bridges may not be the agency awarded the contract. Committee-member Miele hoped the set aside would be used strictly for Navigator services. Committee-member Miele commented on the lack of available funds for CDBG to recommend allocating to the service.

Committee-member Rubio asked Mr. Hess if the \$57,000 request from Community Bridges could be deducted from the set aside.

Committee-member Miele asked if the set aside would be used for Navigation Services. Mr. Hess replied that it more or less would. Mr. Hess explained that the City RFP will be able to dictate the services the City wants in order to move the needle on homelessness. Committee-member Miele asked if Navigation would be part of the program. Mr. Hess replied in the positive, but was not sure exactly what it would look like.

Committee-member Rubio requested that the \$57,000 be given back to CDAC to allocate and staff and Council determine how to proceed with an RFP for the following fiscal year. Chair Dvorak asked if this request could be made. Mr. Hess will pass on the request to Council.

Committee-member Miele appreciated the City taking ownership of the homelessness situation and stressed the importance of Navigation. Committee-member Miele asked when Community Bridges Navigation Services contract ended. Mr. Hess replied the contract ends on June 30, 2020. Committee-member Miele asked if there would be something in place to pick up the service after the contract ends. Mr. Hess relayed that the procurement could be finished and in effect for July 1, 2020. Committee-member Miele stated that she did not have any ties to Community Bridges, but just did not want to lose the momentum developed. Committee-member Miele commented that Phoenix Rescue Mission might have to step in and she was unsure of their capacity.

Committee-member Hopp-Newman suggested funding Sojourner at \$7,500.00 and Street Light at \$12,233.00.

Committee-member Hopp-Newman recused herself from the deliberation on Valley Life. Vice Chair Baker recused herself from deliberation on Angels on Patrol.

**Motion by Vice Chair Baker, second by Committee-member Giles approve the following CDBG, ESG, and HOME HUD FY2020-21 grant recommendations to City Council:**

**PUBLIC SERVICES:**

- 1. A New Leaf: Faith House – No funding**
- 2. Angels on Patrol: Crisis Response - \$5,000.00**

3. **Central Arizona Shelter Services, Inc. (CASS): Norton and Ramsey Social Justice Empowerment Center – No funding**
4. **City of Glendale Community Services, Community Revitalization: Glendale Works - \$50,000.00**
5. **City of Glendale Community Action Program: Eviction Prevention – \$40,000.00**
6. **Community Bridges: Housing Navigation Homeless Services – No funding**
7. **Community Bridges: Homeless Navigation Services - Revisit**
8. **Community Legal Services: Fair Housing Education - \$5,000.00**
9. **Community Legal Services: Housing Legal Services – No funding**
10. **Family Promise: Glendale Emergency Shelter - \$15,000.00**
11. **Homeward Bound: Integrated Family Services – No funding**
12. **Marc Community Resources: Employment Specialist – No funding**
13. **Phoenix Rescue Mission: Emergency Food Distribution – No funding**
14. **Sojourner Center: Emergency Shelter and Services – No funding**
15. **St. Vincent de Paul: Homeless Prevention - \$20,000**
16. **UMOM New Day Centers: Family Emergency Shelter – No funding**
17. **Chrysalis: Victim Services - \$10,000.00**
18. **Sojourner Center: Lay Legal Domestic Violence Victims – No funding**
19. **Arizona YWCA Metro Phoenix: Senior Nutrition Program - \$40,000.00**
20. **Duet Partners in Health and Aging: Vital Services to Seniors - \$15,000.00**
21. **Back to School Clothing Drive: New Clothes, New Beginnings – No funding**
22. **Boys & Girls Clubs Metro Phoenix: Swift Kids Academic Success - \$10,000.00**
23. **Catholic Charities Community Services: West Side Head Start - \$21,026.00**
24. **City of Glendale Community Services, Community Revitalization: Youth Employment Program – No funding**
25. **Homeless Youth Connection: Empowering Youth for the Future - \$15,000.00**
26. **Best Buddies International: Inclusion Project – No funding**

#### **PHYSICAL IMPROVEMENT**

27. **Glencroft Center for Modern Aging – Elevator Repairs to Senior Housing Facilities: \$143,288.00**
28. **Habitat for Humanity Central Arizona – Emergency Home Repair: \$425,000.00**
29. **Valleylife – Group Home Renovations: \$100,000.00**
30. **City of Glendale Parks, Recreation & Special Events - ADA Park Improvements: \$76,343.00**
31. **City of Glendale Parks, Recreation & Special Events – Murphy Park Irrigation Improvements: \$121,098.00**

#### **ESG**

32. **A New Leaf – Faith House ESG: \$33,000.00**
33. **Central Arizona Shelter Services, Inc. – Emergency Shelter Services: \$30,000.00**
34. **Maggie’s Place – The Michael House: \$15,000.00**
35. **Phoenix Rescue Mission – Street Outreach: \$21,540.00**
36. **StreetLight USA – Shelter Utilities: \$12,233.00**
37. **Sojourner Center – Shelter Utilities: \$7,500.00**

#### **HOME**

- 38. Casa de Amigos Affordable Housing – Montebello Apartments: No funding**
- 39. Habitat for Humanity Central Arizona - Affordable Housing: \$252,095.56**
- 40. City of Glendale Housing Authority – Tenant Based Rental Assistance: \$225,000.00**
- 41. Community Bridges - Tenant Based Rental Assistance: No funding**

**Motion carried 11 – 0.**

#### **4. COMMITTEE-MEMBER COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS**

None.

#### **5. NEXT MEETING**

The next regular meeting of the Community Development Advisory Committee will be held on February 20, 2020 at 6:30 p.m. in conference room B-3 of the Municipal Office Complex, located at Glendale City Hall, 5850 W. Glendale Avenue, Glendale, Arizona, 85301.

#### **6. ADJOURNMENT**

**Motion by Vice Chair Baker, second by Committee-member Hopp-Newman, to adjourn the meeting at 7:56 p.m. Motion carried 11 – 0.**

Respectfully submitted,

Denise Kazmierczak