

DRAFT



MINUTES

**GOVERNMENT SERVICES COMMITTEE
CITY HALL
COUNCIL CONFERENCE ROOM
5850 W. GLENDALE AVE.
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**MAY 26, 2020
10:30 A.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Councilmember Clark called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Joyce Clark, Vice Mayor
Jamie Aldama, Councilmember

Absent: Lauren Tolmachoff, Councilmember

Also Present: Julie K. Bower, City Clerk

3. CITIZEN COMMENTS

None

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

1. Approval of the minutes of the March 3, 2020 Government Services Committee meeting

Motioned by Councilmember Jamie Aldama, seconded by Vice Mayor Joyce Clark to approve the minutes of the March 3, 2020 Government Services Committee meeting.

AYE: Vice Mayor Joyce Clark

Councilmember Jamie Aldama

Other: Councilmember Lauren Tolmachoff (ABSENT)

Passed

5. RESIGNATIONS

- Chris Fundis, Barrel District, Citizen Transportation Oversight Commission, effective April 17, 2020
- Tim Wayne, Cholla District, Community Development Advisory Committee, effective April 28, 2020

6. NEW BUSINESS

1. DISCUSSION OF THE HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION REQUEST FOR ACCESS TO ITS BOARD AND COMMISSION WEB PAGE

Brittany Leslie, Human Relations Commission (HRC) Staff Liaison, said the HRC was requesting access to a SharePoint page or a Google drive to allow the HRC members to store and work on its strategic plan document. She was concerned because of a possible open meeting law violation because members would be working on it outside of a public meeting. Members felt it would provide consistency and the ability to print off a current copy before each meeting.

Councilmember Aldama asked if that was currently staff's responsibility.

Ms. Leslie did provide copies of the current version of the plan to the members at each meeting. She would continue to provide the copies but members wanted to be able work on it outside of the meeting.

Councilmember Clark was reluctant to allow that because of the open meeting law. She preferred that members work through Ms. Leslie and discussion and changes take place at the public meeting.

Councilmember Aldama asked if any problems were resulting from the lack of an online document.

Ms. Leslie did not believe there were any problems with the current process. It made the meetings more productive and all members heard the discussion regarding proposed changes. It also eliminated the risk of any open meeting law violations.

Councilmember Aldama agreed that the current process was more transparent.

There was consensus to leave the process as it was.

2. GOVERNMENT SERVICES COMMITTEE POLICY FOR FILLING BOARD AND COMMISSION VACANCIES

Ms. Bower said some of the board and commission vacancies had been vacant for quite some time for a variety of reasons. The Government Services Committee (GSC) had indicated a procedure was needed for filling vacancies. There had been discussion that after a certain time period, if the vacancy was not filled, the GSC would review applications and make a recommendation.

Councilmember Aldama said there had been very few interested applicants. He said the first step would be for the Councilmember whose district the vacancy was in, would recommend an appointment from district applications. If there were no viable district candidates, the Councilmember would work with other Councilmembers on filling the vacancy from outside of the district. If that step was not successful, the vacancy would be referred to the GSC for a recommendation.

Councilmember Clark clarified that procedure would remain the same with a final review by GSC before the recommendation was considered by the full Council.

Councilmember Aldama agreed.

Councilmember Clark asked what the time limit would be for the Councilmember to make a recommendation before it went to the GSC.

There was consensus for a 90-day time period.

Ms. Bower was directed to create a draft policy for review at the next meeting.

3. REVIEW RESULTS OF ANNUAL BOARD AND COMMISSION MEMBER SATISFACTION SURVEY

Ms. Bower distributed the results of the annual survey. The survey had been sent to 112 members and 79 responses were received.

Councilmember Aldama said it was a positive survey.

Councilmember Clark noted the following comments:

"This survey includes too many forced answer questions. The second question is unchanged from last year, and still does not tell Council if a member's 3 absences occurred in one term or five. And it does not identify how often a Board or Commission meets in relation to the number of meetings missed. Question 4 does not make sense. Each Council Member and the Mayor should select one current B & C member who has chaired a commission to serve on a committee to construct a survey that would inform Council of relevant issues. This instrument does not appear to have been constructed by anyone who has SERVED on a Board or Commission recently."

Councilmember Clark was not sure it was necessary to form another committee. She suggested that each board and commission be given the opportunity to submit questions to the GSC to update next year's survey.

Councilmember Aldama agreed.

"Senior City Management gives impression of tolerating, but not embracing board and commission input. There increasingly appears to be an effort to pre-determine the outcome of some issues before the commission by manipulating the process and "going through the motions" with token public input which does not accurately reflect public sentiment."

Councilmember Clark suggested the GSC draft a memo for staff liaisons to remind them that staff's role was not to advocate for a pre-determined outcome but to provide both sides of the issue and let the board or commission make the decision.

Councilmember Aldama agreed.

Councilmember Aldama noted the following comment:

"It would be nice to have a little interaction with mayor and council to get an idea of what they would like to see from us"

Councilmember Aldama did not meet with board and commission members because he did not want to give the impression that he was trying to influence decisions being made by the members.

Councilmember Clark said an explanation could be provided at the next board and commission dinner.

Ms. Bower said last year's survey had contained similar comments. The City Attorney had suggested that Councilmembers attend the first few minutes of board and commission meetings to make introductions and provide information and leave the meeting before any business was conducted.

Councilmember Clark asked Ms. Bower to start scheduling her attendance at board and commission meetings.

"1. Let the group dig in the most we do is listen to Info no action items 2. We need to help guide the direction of the commission 3. When we do have an idea and speak it our director tells us we can't do items like that"

Councilmember Aldama had heard similar comments from board and commission members in the past. Members felt like no action was being taken. He suggested the advisory role of each board and commission be explained.

Councilmember Clark would add that to the information she presented at each board and commission meeting.

Ms. Bower was directed to provide the entire Council with the survey results and actions being taken.

4. REVIEW BOARD AND COMMISSION ANNUAL GOALS

Councilmember Clark said the goals for the Aviation Advisory Commission were very specific and were great goals.

Councilmember Clark wanted the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission (CTOC) to focus on the Glendale Long Range Transportation Program; Future of Transportation; and Active Transportation Plan Update/Implementation. She wanted to confirm that the CTOC would be working on the action items.

Councilmember Aldama agreed.

Councilmember Clark said the goals for the Citizens Utility Advisory Commission included Water/Sewer Rate Study Discussion. She had received comments that when the discussion was held, the information received from staff was preordained to receive a certain outcome. She wanted to use it as an example in the memo to staff liaisons.

Councilmember Clark wanted to see the Library Advisory Board take on some high level planning on the future of libraries in Glendale and provide a report. Was there a particular concept or project that the board would like to research and report on.

Councilmember Aldama liked the Library Advisory Board's goal of continuing to promote awareness. The City could not continue to invest resources if the libraries were not utilized. The Board needed to focus on the issue of participation and provide strategies for increasing participation.

Councilmember Clark asked why the Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission was not given the opportunity to review and make recommendations for the department's work plan.

Councilmember Aldama agreed. When he was a member of the Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission, there was frustration because commission members were only presented with staff's recommendations. It should not work that way.

Councilmember Clark said the Arts Commission's budget was increasing by \$121,000. The Commission should be more active in the community. It should seek out and develop a list of artists for the City to use at City events such as Glendale Glitters to upgrade the quality of offerings.

Councilmember Aldama said other cities were doing significantly more with artists.

Councilmember Clark wanted the Commission to develop an event for fine art and wine at the Civic Center.

Councilmember Aldama suggested that it also include the Chocolate Experience. The Commission needed to know it could think outside of the box. He wanted to know what the Commission's budget was used for last year.

Councilmember Aldama asked why the Community Development Advisory Committee's (CDAC) goals was not included.

Ms. Bower said the CDAC did not submit any goals.

Councilmember Aldama said the process needed to be changed for the use of Community Development Block Grants.

The GSC also wanted to goals for the Audit Committee, Historic Preservation Commission, Code Review and CDAC.

5. DISCUSSION OF NEW DATE FOR THE ANNUAL BOARD AND COMMISSION MEMBER APPRECIATION DINNER

Ms. Bower asked if the dinner should be rescheduled this year or wait until next year to hold it.

Councilmember Clark suggested a date in September.

Councilmember Aldama said it was unknown if COVID-19 would start up again in the fall. He asked if there was some way to provide a gift to board and commission members this year.

Ms. Bower said bags and portfolios were going to be given out to members at the dinner. The gifts could be distributed to members through staff liaisons at upcoming board and commission meetings.

There was consensus to postpone the dinner until next year and distribute gifts to members.

7. MOTION TO ENTER INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Motioned by Councilmember Jamie Aldama, seconded by Vice Mayor Joyce Clark to hold an executive session.

AYE: Vice Mayor Joyce Clark
Councilmember Jamie Aldama

Other: Councilmember Lauren Tolmachoff (ABSENT)

Passed

8. EXECUTIVE SESSION

The Government Services Committee met in executive session at 11:10 a.m. for discussion and consideration of appointments to various boards and commissions and other bodies pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03(A)(1).

Motioned by Councilmember Jamie Aldama, seconded by Vice Mayor Joyce Clark to adjourn the executive session.

AYE: Vice Mayor Joyce Clark

Councilmember Jamie Aldama

Other: Councilmember Lauren Tolmachoff (ABSENT)

Passed

Councilmember Clark adjourned the executive session at 11:12 a.m.

9. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the Government Services Committee will be held on June 16, 2020 at 10:30 a.m. in the Council Conference Room, 5850 West Glendale Avenue, Glendale, Arizona.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The Government Services Committee meeting minutes of May 26, 2020 were submitted and approved this ___ day of _____, 2020.

Julie K. Bower, MMC
City Clerk