



**DRAFT MINUTES**  
**CITIZENS TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMISSION**  
**VIRTUAL MEETING**  
**APRIL 1, 2021**  
**6:00 P.M.**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Fernandes called the meeting to order at 6:15 p.m.

**2. ROLL CALL**

Present: John Fernandes, Chair  
Marie Nesfield, Vice Chair  
Patrick Lowry, Commissioner  
Paul Marsh, Commissioner  
Kelley Sandstedt, Commissioner  
Christopher Sund, Commissioner

Absent: Jon Pickett, Commissioner  
Barbara Rose, Commissioner

Also Present: Purab Adabala, Transportation Planning Administrator  
Patrick Sage, Transportation Planner  
Ashley Knudsen, Transportation Planner  
Marilu Garcia Ramirez, Transportation Analyst  
Matt Dudley, Transportation Program Manager  
Kevin Link, Transit Administrator  
Javier Gurrola, City Pavement Manager  
Trevor Ebersole, Transportation Department Director  
Russ Romney, Assistant City Attorney

**3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA - WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES**

**ACTION BY CTOC:** Approval of the agenda for the April 1, 2021 Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting, as submitted.

Motioned by Vice Chair Marie Nesfield, seconded by Commissioner Patrick Lowry

AYE: Chair John Fernandes  
Vice Chair Marie Nesfield  
Commissioner Patrick Lowry  
Commissioner Paul Marsh  
Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt

Commissioner Christopher Sund  
Passed

**4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES**

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the minutes from the March 4, 2021 meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission, as written.

Motioned by Commissioner Patrick Lowry, seconded by Commissioner Christopher Sund

AYE: Chair John Fernandes  
Vice Chair Marie Nesfield  
Commissioner Patrick Lowry  
Commissioner Paul Marsh  
Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt  
Commissioner Christopher Sund

Passed

**5. CITIZEN COMMENTS**

No citizen comments were received either by email or voicemail.

**6. PROJECT UPDATE - GLENDALE MICROTRANSIT PILOT**

Mr. Dudley gave a presentation on the Glendale Microtransit Pilot Program, which included information on the following:

- Agency-owned microtransit is an on-demand, ride-share service. A person can use a smartphone app to request a ride pick-up and drop-off within the service boundaries.
- Public & private sector collaboration
- Common Use Cases for microtransit
- Getting Started – Transloc/Ford: Pilot Program start date – March 2020
- Why Dial-A-Ride modernization?
- Service specifics
- On-demand and GUS bus interface
- Rider experience
- Pilot program statistics
- Pilot results (pros and cons)
- Next steps

Commissioner Marsh stated the program appeared to cost a lot for a small ridership. Mr. Link explained the services and busses have already been operating and the program is more of a replacement of those services and modernization of the scheduling software.

Chair Fernandes inquired as to why the Westgate entertainment district was not included in the program. Mr. Link relayed the program could be expanded to other areas depending on the results of the pilot program.

Commissioner Lowry inquired as to the target audience for the program. Mr. Adabala relayed the target audience as seniors, the disabled, those with ADA needs, and also the general public. Commissioner Lowry noted the free fare and asked how the program was being advertised. Mr. Adabala replied the program was being advertised via the usual methods and will send an email to the Commissioners with the various means. Mr. Link signed off the meeting.

Commissioner Lowry indicated he had additional questions, and inquired as to the target audience for the program. Mr. Adabala relayed the target audience as seniors, the disabled, those with ADA needs, and also the general public. Commissioner noted the free fare and asked how the program was being advertised. Mr. Adabala replied the program was being advertised via the usual methods and will provide Commissioners with additional details from Mr. Link. Mr. Sage stated he will contact Mr. Link to re-join the meeting to address additional questions from the commissioners.

Following the Pavement Management Reconstruction Program Update presentation, Mr. Link rejoined the meeting.

Commissioner Lowry stated he was surprised at the low ridership of the microtransit as it was free at this time. Mr. Link stated the pandemic had a lot to do with decrease ridership, even with Dial-A-Ride and other programs. Mr. Link said the program was advertised via flyers at the library, notices on the Valley Metro site, and phone messages on the department's 'on hold' line. Mr. Link explained when the program is launched in full, there will be a fare charge again. Commissioner Lowry asked if the fare would return to \$2.00. Mr. Link stated the fare would be reviewed and there may be a re-structured fare system. Commissioner Lowry announced he volunteers with an organization that provides rides to seniors and suggested this may be another target audience. Commissioner Lowry indicated he would like to speak with Mr. Link at another time regarding the program. Mr. Link concurred.

Commissioner Marsh asked if there was a bike lane at Camelback Ranch from Ball Park Boulevard to Westgate. Mr. Sage explained there was a trail on the west side of Ball Park Boulevard that extends to Glendale Avenue, and Glendale Avenue has a wide shoulder that can be used by bicyclists. Mr. Adabala elaborated that the Grand Canal path provides a connection from Ballpark Boulevard/New River Trail to the area immediately south of Westgate, where riders can then use surface streets to bike between the Grand Canal Path and Westgate.

The item was concluded.

## **7. PAVEMENT MANAGEMENT & RECONSTRUCTION PROGRAM UPDATE**

Mr. Gurrola gave an update on the Pavement Management and Reconstruction Program (PMP) and the Arterial Reconstruction Program (ARP), which included the following information:

- FY2021 PMP Expenditures To Date
- Arterial Reconstruction Program (ARP)
- Glendale Ave. Reconstruction – 99th Ave. to El Mirage Rd.
- Camelback Road Reconstructions – 83rd Ave. to 91st Ave.
- Bell Road Reconstruction – 51st Ave. to 59th Ave.

## **8. DRAFT 10-YEAR TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM**

Ms. Garcia Ramirez gave a presentation on the update to the 10-Year Transportation Program for FY2022-2031.

Commissioner Lowry asked if he could attend the Council's budget workshops. Ms. Garcia Ramirez replied in the positive and stated that there was currently remote access for the public to watch the workshops. Chair Fernandez noted the meetings were on Glendale Live. Mr. Adabala explained the public cannot attend the budget workshops in person at this time, but can view the meetings on Facebook Live and YouTube as well Glendale Live.

Commissioner Marsh stated that he drafted a recommendation regarding funding for active

transportation projects in the 10-Year Transportation Program, which he would like the Commission to consider. Commissioner Marsh read aloud his recommendation for consideration:

*With the completion of the Active Transportation Plan and the need to be good stewards of the time and funds that went into this plan, the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission strongly recommends that the Glendale Transportation Department attach a much higher priority, with corresponding additional funds, for more rapid completion of more active transportation projects in the current draft of the 10-year Transportation Program for FY 2022-2031.*

Commissioner Marsh elaborated that he is not identifying specific projects or a targeted funding amount.

Mr. Sage reminded commissioners that staff was requesting their action on the agenda item, and to consider support of the draft 10-Year Transportation program as presented, or include adoption the additional language as proposed by Commissioner Marsh.

Commissioner Sund offered a motion to recommend the 10-Year Transportation Program as presented by staff. That motion was passed by the commission.

Commissioner Marsh made a second motion to forward his recommendation regarding active transportation funding and prioritization. The motion was seconded by Chair Fernandes. A majority of commissioners abstained from voting (Vice Chair Nesfield and commissioners Lowry, Sandstedt and Sund), resulting in the motion failing. Commissioners requested an agenda item for the next meeting that provides additional information on active transportation planning and funding, and the opportunity to re-consider Commissioner Marsh's recommendation after receiving that information.

Motioned by Commissioner Christopher Sund, seconded by Vice Chair Marie Nesfield  
ACTION BY CTOC: Recommendation for Council adoption of the 10-Year Transportation Program for FY2022-2031, as presented by staff.

AYE: Chair John Fernandes  
Vice Chair Marie Nesfield  
Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt  
Commissioner Christopher Sund

NAY: Commissioner Paul Marsh

Other: Commissioner Patrick Lowry (ABSTAIN)

Passed

## **9. MANAGER'S REPORT**

Mr. Adabala gave the Manager's Report, which included information on the following:

- Loop 101 / 75th Avenue Interchange ADOT project update
- Northern Parkway updates
- FY2022 Budget/CIP schedule
- Current and upcoming Glendale construction projects
- Glendale design projects

## **10. COMMISSIONER UPDATES**

None.

**11. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

No additional suggestions for agenda items were made.

**12. NEXT MEETING**

The next regular meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission will be held on Thursday, May 6, 2021 at 6:00 p.m.

**13. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Fernandes adjourned the meeting at 7:49 p.m.

The Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting minutes of April 1, 2021 were submitted and approved this third day of June, 2021.

---

Patrick Sage  
Recording Secretary