



**DRAFT MINUTES**  
**CITIZENS TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMISSION**  
**VIRTUAL MEETING**  
**JUNE 3, 2021**  
**6:00P.M.**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Fernandes called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

**2. ROLL CALL**

Present: John Fernandes, Chair  
Marie Nesfield, Vice Chair  
Gary Hirsch, Commissioner  
Patrick Lowry, Commissioner  
Paul Marsh, Commissioner  
Barbara Rose, Commissioner  
Kelley Sandstedt, Commissioner  
Christopher Sund, Commissioner

Also Present: Purab Adabala, Transportation Planning Administrator  
Patrick Sage, Transportation Planner  
Marilu Garcia, Transportation Analyst  
Javier Gurrola, Pavement Management Program Manager  
Matt Dudley, Transit Planner  
Erin Steffa, Operations Budget Analyst  
Trevor Ebersole, Department Director  
Russ Romney, Assistant City Attorney

**3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA - WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES**

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the agenda for the June 3, 2021 Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting, as submitted.

Motioned by Commissioner Barbara Rose, seconded by Vice Chair Marie Nesfield

AYE: Chair John Fernandes  
Vice Chair Marie Nesfield  
Commissioner Gary Hirsch  
Commissioner Patrick Lowry  
Commissioner Paul Marsh  
Commissioner Barbara Rose

Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt  
Commissioner Christopher Sund

Passed

**4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES**

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the minutes from the April 1, 2021 meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission as written.

Motioned by Commissioner Christopher Sund, seconded by Commissioner Patrick Lowry

AYE: Chair John Fernandes  
Vice Chair Marie Nesfield  
Commissioner Patrick Lowry  
Commissioner Paul Marsh  
Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt  
Commissioner Christopher Sund

Other: Commissioner Gary Hirsch (ABSTAIN)  
Commissioner Barbara Rose (ABSTAIN)

Passed

**5. CITIZEN COMMENTS**

Mr. Sage informed the commission that no citizen comments were received either by email or voicemail.

**6. GLENDALE TRANSIT SERVICES**

Mr. Dudley gave a presentation on Transit Services in Glendale, which included information on the following:

- Public Transportation Defined
  - Public Transportation Systems
  - Benefits of Public Transportation
- Glendale Transit History
- Glendale Transit Options
  - Fixed Route Service
  - Paratransit Service
  - Park Ride Facilities
  - Bus Stop Facilities
- Ridership (FY2020)
- Funding Sources (FY2020)

Commissioner Sund asked who the public should contact if they see issues with bus stop maintenance. Mr. Dudley stated that a request or comment can be submitted on GlendaleOne, by calling the Transportation Department, or by calling Valley Metro. Commissioner Sund stated that he submitted a report on GlendaleOne regarding a bus stop with drug paraphernalia, however the system does not confirm if the request was received or being addressed. Commissioner Sund relayed that the bus stop was at the northwest corner of 51st Avenue and Bell Road.

Chair Fernandes reported that it was very hard to pinpoint an address on GlendaleOne when submitting a request from a different location than that of the site being reported on. Mr. Sage will forward on the comment to the appropriate contact.

Commissioner Marsh asked if the City would re-consider light rail, as some residents would like to see it implemented. Mr. Dudley replied there were no discussions on light rail at this time.

Vice Chair Nesfield inquired if anything could be done at the bus stops to prevent people from doing drugs and sleeping on the benches. Mr. Dudley relayed funds have been spent to retrofit the benches with vandal bars, which prevent someone from lying down. Mr. Dudley stated that the Department has good relationships with the Community Service Division and Phoenix Rescue Mission, who provide services or street outreach. Vice Chair Nesfield reported a number of homeless individuals at the 59th Avenue and Bethany Home Road bus stop recently.

Chair Fernandes inquired about prices per ride for Dial A Ride and the ADA taxi service and the cost to the City. Mr. Dudley provided rates and explained that these services were highly subsidized by the City and through federal funds; however, Glendale was one of the most effective in providing the services. Mr. Dudley equated these services to a quality of life amenity.

Chair Fernandes inquired if transit ridership was expected to change as more people were working from home due to COVID. Mr. Dudley relayed the fixed routes were more resilient. However, the express ridership remains low, does van-pool ridership. Mr. Dudley reported that if these decreases remain, right-sizing of current services and facilities may be required.

The agenda item was concluded.

## **7. PAVEMENT MANAGEMENT & RECONSTRUCTION PROGRAM UPDATE**

Mr. Gurrola gave an update on the Pavement Management and Reconstruction Program (PMP) and the Arterial Reconstruction Program (ARP), which included the following information:

- FY2021 PMP expenditures to date show \$13.4 million used of the \$15.2 million allocation
- Arterial Reconstruction Program (ARP) Activity
  - Glendale Ave. Reconstruction – 99th Ave. to El Mirage Road
  - Camelback Road Reconstructions – 83rd Ave. to 91st Ave.
  - Bell Road Reconstruction – 51st Ave. to 59th Ave.

Commissioner Marsh reported that a residential sealing contractor left their 'no parking' signage behind and it has been a week since the sealing was done. Commissioner Marsh relayed the signs were located north and west of 59th Avenue and Union Hills Road. Mr. Gurrola will follow up with the contractor.

Commissioner Rose inquired about the difference between using concrete under asphalt, such as at Camelback Road, versus using asphalt under concrete, such as at Glendale Avenue. Mr. Gurrola clarified that concrete was not being used under the asphalt on Camelback Road, rather the material was a muddy cement product used to stabilize the foundation. Mr. Gurrola stated that due to the large amount of heavy truck traffic along Glendale Avenue, the layers of the new road improvements are the muddy cement mix, asphalt, and then concrete.

The agenda item was concluded.

**8. FY2022 TRANSPORTATION CIP & OPERATING BUDGET UPDATE**

Ms. Garcia Ramirez and Ms. Steffa gave an update on the FY2022 CIP & Operating Budget.

Ms. Garcia Ramirez presented information on the following items:

- FY2022 Capital Costs by Funding Source: Estimated Total \$42.5 million
- 10-Year Capital Costs by Funding Source: Estimated Total \$202.4 million

Ms. Steffa presented information on the following items:

- FY2022 Operational Costs by Funding Source
- 10-Year O&M Program by Funding Source
- Operating Budget – Transportation Sales Tax
- Operating Budget - HURF

Ms. Garcia Ramirez continued her presentation, which included financial charts, on the following:

- 10-Year Funding Sources (FY2022-2031)
- Transportation Sales Tax Summary

Commissioner Hirsch requested clarification of the Illegal Dumping Mitigation Program. Mr. Ebersole explained this was a new program beginning on June 8<sup>th</sup>, which will address illegal dumping and homeless camps citywide. Mr. Ebersole stated teams consist of two members with a tractor truck and trailer, who will work on cleaning up illegal dumping and transient camps. Mr. Ebersole noted the program was a coordinated effort between Field Operations and the Police Department.

Commissioner Hirsch relayed there was a recent policy change at the Glendale landfill which modified the tipping costs for small loads. He expressed concern that the change would induce more dumping regarding and asked if illegal dumping has increased throughout the year. Mr. Ebersole stated Ms. Michelle Woytenko, Field Operations Director, would have specific data, however, he surmised illegal dumping had increased.

Commissioner Hirsch explained at the Landfill, customers used to pay based on the actual weight of the material, however with COVID, customers were now paying for a minimum of one ton. He believed a lot of operators were illegally dumping materials to avoid the increase in cost. Commissioner Hirsch expressed interest in receiving the specific data from Ms. Woytenko. Mr. Ebersole acknowledged that Commissioner Hirsch's suspicion could be correct; however, he believes that the majority of the illegal dumping is due to the homeless camps.

The agenda item was concluded.

**9. GLENDALE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PLAN**

Mr. Sage provided an overview of the Glendale Active Transportation Plan (ATP), which included the following:

- ATP Basics
- Review Existing Conditions
- Needs Assessment and Prioritization
- Recommendations and Implementation
- Recently Completed Grant Projects
- ATP Projects Underway with Grant Funds
- Ongoing Actions

Mr. Sage concluded his presentation.

Commission Marsh thanked staff for its hard work to develop the plan and its implementation. Commissioner Sund concurred and expressed his appreciation for the bike lanes and bike

paths in the City, and Chair Fernandes commented on improvements to the roads and paths in the City.

Mr. Sage announced that Commissioner Marsh would like to revisit his motion as presented at the April meeting.

Commissioner Marsh stated that there were a lot of funds potentially involved in the ATP. He expressed his biggest concern with the 10-Year Plan as that the amount allocated to the ATP was very low. He stated his recommendation was basically for active transportation to be given a higher priority and more funding in the future. He explained that he has modified his motion from the April meeting in regards its timing and to keep it more generic. He read his modified recommendation aloud as follows:

*With the completion of the Active Transportation Plan and the need to be good stewards of the time and funds that went into this plan, the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission strongly recommends that the Glendale Transportation Department attach a much higher priority, with corresponding additional funds, for more rapid completion of more active transportation projects in future 10-Year Transportation Programs.*

Chair Fernandes inquired about any changes if the recommendation was approved. Mr. Sage replied the recommendation would be part of the Commission's record and City Council would be advised of the recommendation. Mr. Sage commented that any impact on future department budgets is at the discretion of Council. Commissioner Marsh stated his recommendation was not a proposal to City Council, rather only to the Transportation Department. Mr. Sage clarified that any action taken by CTOC was advisory to Council and therefore, this recommendation would flow to Council.

**ACTION BY CTOC:** Approval of Commissioner Marsh's recommendation regarding activity transportation funding and prioritization as modified and read aloud.

Motioned by Commissioner Paul Marsh, seconded by Chair John Fernandes

AYE: Chair John Fernandes  
Vice Chair Marie Nesfield  
Commissioner Paul Marsh  
Commissioner Barbara Rose  
Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt  
Commissioner Christopher Sund

NAY: Commissioner Gary Hirsch  
Commissioner Patrick Lowry

Passed

## 10. **MANAGER'S REPORT**

Mr. Adabala gave the Manager's Report, which included information on the following:

- Loop 101 / 75th Avenue Interchange
- Northern Parkway Updates
- FY2022 Budget/CIP Schedule
- Construction Projects
- Ongoing Construction Projects
- Upcoming Construction Projects
- Design Projects
- Pre-Design Projects

**11. COMMISSIONER UPDATES**

Commissioner Sund reported that he and his family participated in the Glendale Family Bike Ride and it was a great experience and event. Commissioner Sund expressed appreciation of staff and staff's support.

Chair Fernandes reported that he attended the groundbreaking for the new Heroes Park lake, which was twenty years in the making. He stated the Mayor and various council members were in attendance and said the project was very exciting.

**12. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Commissioner Sund requested consideration of additional family events like the Glendale Family Bike Ride, that would bring the community together.

**13. NEXT MEETING**

The next regular meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission is scheduled for Thursday, July 1, 2021 at 6:00 p.m.

**14. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Fernandes adjourned the meeting at 8:03 p.m.

The Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting minutes of June 3, 2021 were submitted and approved this first day of July, 2021.

---

Patrick Sage  
Recording Secretary