



DRAFT MINUTES

**CITIZENS TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMISSION
VIRTUAL MEETING**

**FEBRUARY 3, 2022
6:00P.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 6:09 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Christopher Sund, Commissioner
Paul Marsh, Commissioner
Marc Floyd, Commissioner
Patrick Lowry, Commissioner
Kelley Sandstedt, Commissioner
Tim Sprague, Commissioner

Also Present: Patrick Sage, Transportation Planner
Purab Adabala, Transportation Planning Administrator
Javier Gurrola, Pavement Management Program Manager
Dan Cleavenger, Interim Transportation Director
Tony Abbo, City Traffic Engineer
Russ Romney, Assistant City Attorney
Kevin Link, Transit Administrator

3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA - WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the agenda for the February 3, 2022 Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission, as submitted.

Motioned by Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt, seconded by Commissioner Patrick Lowry

AYE: Commissioner Christopher Sund
Commissioner Paul Marsh
Commissioner Marc Floyd
Commissioner Patrick Lowry
Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt
Commissioner Tim Sprague

Passed

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the minutes from the January 6, 2022 meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission, as submitted.

Motioned by Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt, seconded by Commissioner Paul Marsh

AYE: Commissioner Christopher Sund
Commissioner Paul Marsh
Commissioner Marc Floyd
Commissioner Patrick Lowry
Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt
Commissioner Tim Sprague

Passed

5. CITIZEN COMMENTS

Mr. Sage reported that there were no citizen comments received either by email or voicemail.

6. BUS & BUS STOP ADVERTISING

Mr. Link announced that this agenda item was initiated by a Council Item of Special Interest, and that Council provided consensus for staff to issue a Request for Information (RFI) to solicit statements of interest from vendors. Mr. Link informed the CTOC that staff will present responses to the RFI to Council within the next few weeks.

Mr. Link gave a presentation, which included the following:
Upcoming Council Discussions on the project:

- RFI responses
- Determination whether Glendale should move forward with a transit advertising program
- If moving forward, determine the best option to implement

Advertising Media Categories

- Static – posters in a display case (most common)
- Bus advertising – bus wrap
- Digital & LED – digital type display
- Audio – recorded message at shelters or on buses (least common)

City Comparisons

- Data comparing Chandler, Mesa, Peoria, Phoenix for the following:
 - Number of bus stops
 - Contract terms
 - Maintenance
 - Type of advertising used: digital, static, audio, bus wraps
 - Cooperative contract
 - Annual revenue
- Advertising Examples
- Advertising Options
- Staff Recommendation - implement static advertising program at bus stops
 - Table digital advertising at stops due to infrastructure costs and low return on investment
 - Forego advertising on buses for now, revisit at a later date

Chair Sund inquired as to how many buses were in the fleet. Mr. Link replied that there were 29 buses in Glendale's fleet pool: twenty Dial-A-Ride and nine GUS buses.

Chair Sund asked if passengers could see through the wrap. Mr. Link stated that Valley Metro trains are fully wrapped and they are now looking at doing only half wrap for security purposes.

Vice Chair Marsh asked if the city would make money on this program. Mr. Link reported that the city expects to receive 55% of net sales, and although it would not be a large moneymaker, it would still be a revenue generator. Vice Chair Marsh asked if the cost was low for staff to run the program. Mr. Link replied in the positive.

Mr. Link stated that the program will require addressing some existing infrastructure needs to implement the project, such as pouring additional concrete pads for the kiosks. Mr. Link indicated that the advertising vendor can be tasked with constructing the required infrastructure; however, using city staff to perform tasks where possible is likely more efficient and cost-effective. Mr. Link stated that the lighting of the kiosk was important as it sold more ad space and noted much of the lighting in similar application is now solar derived.

Vice Chair Marsh inquired about the number of bus stops in Glendale. Mr. Link stated that there were 595 total bus stops, of which 189 were bus stops with shelters. Mr. Link stated that the upfront costs for the program included adding the ad panels and the concrete slabs.

Commissioner Floyd cautioned that the program must be managed properly to stay within the scope. Mr. Link explained that most contracts have a minimum guarantee after an analysis is conducted by the vendor. Vice Chair Marsh asked who would monitor the program. Mr. Link replied that the contract would be monitored by Glendale Transportation Department staff.

ACTION BY CTOC: Motion to support staff's recommendation to implement the Static Advertising Program at Glendale Bus Stops.

Motioned by Commissioner Paul Marsh, seconded by Commissioner Patrick Lowry

AYE: Commissioner Christopher Sund
Commissioner Paul Marsh
Commissioner Marc Floyd
Commissioner Patrick Lowry
Commissioner Kelley Sandstedt
Commissioner Tim Sprague

Passed

7. PAVEMENT MANAGEMENT & RECONSTRUCTION PROGRAM UPDATE

Mr. Gurrola gave an update on the following:

- FY2022 Pavement Management and Reconstruction Program (PMP) Activity
- Bridge Repair Program
 - Demonstration of the US Department of Transportation (USDOT) InfoBridge portal

Commissioner Floyd asked if InfoBridge includes a report that shows any conditional failings. Mr. Gurrola replied in the positive. Commissioner Floyd asked if there is a condition report pulled from the portal by jurisdiction that would show all Glendale bridges sorted by condition. Mr. Gurrola is coordinating with USDOT staff to determine the reporting opportunities offered through the InfoBridge portal.

Vice Chair Marsh asked if staff prepares an annual or multi-year report showing data on all of Glendale's bridges. He suggested more of a report card for the public so that the public would know which bridges were in good condition or not. Mr. Gurrola demonstrated how to query down to the county level to make a priority list.

Mr. Gurrola announced that normally the department has \$250,000 a year for bridge repairs, which equates to repairing approximately three bridges annually. Vice Chair Marsh inquired how staff decided which bridges to repair. Mr. Gurrola noted that staff prioritizes based multiple factors including condition issues. He relayed that there were no City bridges with safety issues at this time and stressed the need to remain vigilant and address the worst issues first.

The agenda item was concluded.

8. FY2020 GLENDALE ONBOARD PROGRAM ANNUAL REPORT - DRAFT

This item was deferred to a future CTOC meeting.

9. CTOC 2022 AGENDA TOPICS

Mr. Sage facilitated discussion on the CTOC potential topics for 2022. Commissioners received the complete list of proposed topics that the CTOC updates each month.

Commissioners suggested the following additions:

- Vice Chair March suggested a discussion on how Planning and Zoning interfaces with Transportation when planning for new communities and developments.
- Chair Sund suggested an update from the police department on traffic cameras, speeding, and street racing.
- Commissioner Floyd requested a presentation from liaisons from other cities to discuss transportation issues at city boundaries. He clarified further that the presentation could include information on how to coordinate and partner with other communities that share a boundary street with Glendale.

10. MANAGER'S REPORT

Mr. Adabala provided update on the following topics:

- FY 2023 budget process and schedule
- Union Hills/75th Avenue school zone sign visibility updates

11. COMMISSIONER UPDATES

Vice Chair Marsh complimented staff on their timeliness in taking responsibility for resolving issues and requests quickly.

12. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the CTOC will be held on March 3rd, 2022 at 6:00 p.m.

13. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Sund adjourned the meeting at 7:27 p.m.

The Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting minutes of February 3rd, 2022 were submitted and approved this 3rd day of March 2022.

Patrick Sage
Recording Secretary