

**DRAFT MINUTES
CITIZENS TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMISSION
TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT OFFICE
6210 W. MYRTLE AVE., BUILDING A, SUITE 111/112
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**OCTOBER 5, 2023
6:00 P.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Joyce called the meeting to order at 6:03 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Bryon Joyce, Chair
Paul Marsh, Vice Chair
James Ho, Commissioner
Tiana Roberts, Commissioner

Absent: Marc Floyd, Commissioner

Also Present: Purab Adabala, Transportation Deputy Director
Patrick Sage, Transportation Planner
Russ Romney, Assistant City Attorney
Tony Abbo, City Traffic Engineer
Yunpei Zhang, Transportation Planner
Javier Gurrola, Transportation Principal Engineer
Randy Proch, Transportation Planning Administrator
Tracy Klein, Administrative Support Specialist
Rashidul Haque, ADOT Senior Project Manager
Gary Melita, Stanley Consultants Senior Project Manager
Dania Mann, ADOT Assistant Communications Director, Community Relations

3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA – WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES

Commissioner Ho asked why Agenda Item #8 73rd Avenue & Camino San Xavier Transportation Network was not noted on the agenda for action. Mr. Romney said the matter was appealed to the Planning Commission and the actual development issue was outside of the CTOC jurisdiction, as per City Ordinance governing the role of the committee. Commissioner Roberts inquired about the City Ordinance. Mr. Romney said it was the City Ordinance that created CTOC that came from the Glendale Onboard (GO) sales tax. Mr. Romney said the CTOC can listen to various viewpoints on the issue. Mr. Romney explained that if the City Council requested a recommendation from CTOC, CTOC could make a recommendation even if the issue was still under appeal. But for this matter, CTOC commission cannot make recommendations to City Council until it is taken care of because CTOC does not have jurisdiction in matters relating to private development review. Commissioner Roberts requested moving up the issue from Agenda Item #8 to Agenda Item #6.

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the agenda for the October 5, 2023 Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission, with the change of moving Agenda Item #8, 73rd Avenue & Camino San Xavier Transportation Network, to Agenda Item #6.

Motioned by Commissioner James Ho, seconded by Vice Chair Paul Marsh

AYE: Chair Bryon Joyce
Vice Chair Paul Marsh
Commissioner James Ho
Commissioner Tiana Roberts

Other: Commissioner Marc Floyd (Absent)

Passed

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the minutes from the September 7, 2023 meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission, as written.

Motioned by Vice Chair Paul Marsh, seconded by Commissioner James Ho

AYE: Chair Bryon Joyce
Vice Chair Paul Marsh
Commissioner James Ho
Commissioner Tiana Roberts

Other: Commissioner Marc Floyd (Absent)

Passed

5. CITIZEN COMMENTS

Three citizens (Robert Cruz, Yucca District; Helena Johnson-Bodin, Cholla District; Erin Cole, Sahuaro District) addressed the commission as part of this agenda item. See the attached document for the complete comment transcript.

6. 73rd AVENUE & CAMINO SAN XAVIER TRANSPORTATION NETWORK

Mr. Abbo gave a presentation on the 73rd Avenue & Camino San Xavier Transportation Network, which included information on the following:

- Proposed Site
- Roadways
- County Assessor's Map: Displayed
- Access to the Site
- Proposed Development
- Traffic Projections
- Sidewalk Requirement
- Responding to Public Comments from September Meeting

Commissioner Roberts asked if the Commissioners could ask City Council to invite CTOC to make a recommendation on the issue. Mr. Romney said the Commissioners were free to express themselves as private citizens at a City Council meeting or to their City Council person, but not as a CTOC commissioner.

Chair Joyce said the Planning Commission rejected the request and the applicant was appealing the decision and it was going through the process to the City Council. Commissioner Ho said the appeal was going directly to City Council. Chair Joyce said in his experience, if a project did not get past the Planning Commission, it would be hard to get past City Council. Mr. Romney encouraged anyone to express themselves as a private citizen to City Council.

Commissioner Roberts asked if the owners of the private road know about the development. Mr. Abbo believed so. Commissioner Roberts asked if the City approved the development, if it would be a City issue if the owner of the road closed off the road. Mr. Abbo said that would be an issue for the Fire Department. He said it could happen that the owner could close off the road. Commissioner Roberts wondered if there was any liability to the City approving a development that potentially could have no access.

Chair Joyce inquired about the parking ratio per square foot for a hotel. He questioned if there was enough parking spaces. Mr. Abbo said the hotel's full capacity could come from occasional events but not regularly happened and this was handled by the Planning staff under their purview.

Commissioner Roberts said she knew the Commission could not make a recommendation, but she did not think there was appropriate street infrastructure for the development.

7. **LOOP 101, 75TH TO I-17 PROJECT UPDATE**

Mr. Haque and Mr. Melita gave an update on the Loop 101, 75TH to I-17 Project, which included information on the following:

- Project Background and Need
- Project Elements
- Loop 101 Improvements
- 75th Avenue Crossroad Improvements
- Noise Wall Locations
 - Wall Improvements 59th to 51st Avenue – Adjacent to Arrowhead Lakes
- Schedule

Chair Joyce asked why diamond grind was being used versus asphalt and concrete. Mr. Haque said there were three projects selected in the valley by ADOT and MAG as pilot projects for diamond grind treatment, and this was one of them. He said the reason for the pilot projects was to obtain data for big picture decision making and future considerations. Ms. Mann said the asphalt was aging and there was no funding to replace it. She said diamond grind was being looked at as a more sustainable long-term solution. She said it would be regional decision from MAG based on the results of the pilot program.

Chair Joyce said diamond grind was not a smoother road. He said it was impossible to see the lane lines when there was sun glare. Vice Chair Marsh agreed. Ms. Mann said there were two different pilot programs for new striping colors to achieve the best contrast. She said ADOT was getting comments regarding visibility and described the potential new standard for striping.

Chair Joyce asked if the bad patches on Loop 101 from SR51 to I-17 would be fixed. Ms. Mann said they would.

Vice Chair Marsh asked if the pedestrian bridge at 63rd Avenue would be impacted by the widening. Mr. Melita said it would not.

Vice Chair Marsh asked if the additional funding from the legislature for the noise walls was conveyed to the residents in the area. Ms. Mann said a presentation was made to the Arrowhead Lakes HOA residents once ADOT knew of the appropriation. Vice Chair Marsh asked if the residents were supportive. Ms. Mann said they were.

Vice Chair Marsh asked if there were any other intersection changes being addressed, besides 75th Avenue. Mr. Haque said there was public feedback from a February 2022 public meeting regarding the 59th Avenue intersection, however, this would depend on funding. ADOT coordinated with MAG and adjacent jurisdictions initiated a study to evaluate improvement to Loop 101 interchanges at 67th Ave and 59th Ave, the similar recommendation as 75th Ave improvement will be considered for future projects.

Commissioner Roberts asked if there was a difference in heat mitigation with asphalt versus the diamond grind. Mr. Haque did not have knowledge of a difference but would send information if he found any.

Commissioner Ho commented on an article in the Independent newspaper regarding a MAG study on the noise from diamond grind versus rubberized asphalt. Ms. Mann said MAG completed the study at one corridor and it was on the ADOT website. Ms. Mann explained the study and said the conclusion was that diamond grind was not contributing to noise levels.

Mr. Hague relayed that rubberized asphalt was designed for a twenty-year life, but starts to deteriorate around eight to ten years.

8. CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR RECOMMENDATIONS FOR 2024

Mr. Sage explained the process for Chair and Vice Chair recommendations for 2024. He announced that Chair Joyce self-nominated for Chair and Vice Chair Marsh self-nominated for Vice Chair. There were no other nominations voiced.

ACTION BY CTOC: Recommendation that City Council appoint Commissioner Bryon Joyce as the CTOC Chair and Commissioner Paul Marsh as the CTOC Vice Chair, for a one-year term starting February 1, 2024.

Motioned by Commissioner James Ho, seconded by Commissioner Tiana Roberts

AYE: Chair Bryon Joyce
Vice Chair Paul Marsh
Commissioner James Ho
Commissioner Tiana Roberts

Other: Commissioner Marc Floyd (Absent)

Passed

9. RIGHT OF WAY LANDSCAPE UPDATE

Mr. Gurrola provided an update and facilitated discussion on the Right of Way Landscape Update.

Commissioner Roberts asked if there were any changes to the plan that came out of the public meetings. Mr. Gurrola said there were no changes.

Commissioner Roberts asked if there were any comments on the changes to the grass in the medians. Mr. Gurrola said some people commented on removal of the turf but were satisfied with the reason due to the drought.

Commissioner Roberts asked about the use of potable water. Mr. Adabala said that there are three miles of median islands with grass in that area, and one mile was converted to potable water a few years ago. He said effluent water tends to clog irrigation lines, the water gets onto the streets, and onto vehicles and people have complained to staff about damage to their cars. He said staff's preference was to use reclaimed water, however, potable water will be used for these medians. He explained the smart irrigation technology.

Mr. Adabala commented on the Right of Way Maintenance Map and activities.

Mr. Adabala said the artificial turf was a balance between people who still wanted the green look of grass versus none. Commissioner Ho said some people commented that they did not want the fakeness of artificial turf used in another location. Mr. Adabala said turf that looks the most like real grass was chosen for those medians.

Chair Joyce hoped that City Council and the Planning Commission were keeping water consumption in mind when considering new developments.

Mr. Adabala said all City departments were trying to conserve water. He relayed there were incentive programs for private developers but was not sure if there were mandates. He will ask the Development Services and Planning Departments and follow up. Mr. Adabala mentioned within the Right of Way, if it is a prior development for landscaping frontage of Right of Way. During the plan review process, Transportation is using the same standards.

10. PAVEMENT MANAGEMENT PROGRAM UPDATE

Mr. Adabala gave a presentation on the Pavement Management Program (PMP) process, the budget, funding levels, and strategy.

Commissioner Roberts asked when the medians would be done at 67th Avenue. Mr. Adabala said the medians would be done on 67th Avenue in February 2024 and the second median would be done in

2025 and the third in 2026. Commissioner Roberts commented that the project was more deserving of public surveys and more outreach.

Commissioner Ho asked how many miles the City could reconstruct in a year. Mr. Adabala relayed it would be around three miles per year, if the bond passed. Vice Chair Marsh calculated it would take eighteen years to fix the fifty-four miles of failed PCI streets.

Commissioner Ho asked if CTOC had ever recommended that City Council increase funding for pavement maintenance. Mr. Adabala explained that most of the PMP funding came from the Sales Tax fund.

Commissioner Ho asked if CTOC had ever recommended that City Council use funding outside of the Sales Tax for PMP. Commissioner Ho did not think a resident would want to wait eighteen years for their street to be done. Mr. Adabala said CTOC's initial purview was the Sales Tax, however, he will follow up about an additional funding recommendation.

11. GLENDALE GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND – STREETS

Mr. Adabala provided general information and facilitated discussion on the General Obligation (G.O.) Bond for Streets.

Commissioner Ho said that on the FAQ's on the City's bond webpage has twenty-two streets projects listed and the slide shown in the presentation has fifteen.

Mr. Adabala said the fifteen projects were the sample projects presented to the Bond Committee. He explained the Bond Committee asked for more information to be provided to the public. He said the projects were only sample projects, because if for example, the City received grant funds for one of the projects, then the bond funds could be used for another projects.

Commissioner Ho said the perception of the residents was that the projects in the FAQ's were the actual projects. Mr. Adabala explained the FAQ's says 'types of projects'. Vice Chair Marsh said listing the projects in numerical order implied a priority.

Commissioner Ho said it does not say on the document in FAQ's that the projects listed were samples. Mr. Adabala said he passed that comment onto the people who handle the FAQ's.

Commissioner Ho asked why the City did not do the PCI study sooner. Mr. Adabala said the PCI survey is done every three years and takes eight to twelve months to complete.

Commissioner Ho inquired if there was a list of projects that will be funded from the Bond Question #1. Mr. Adabala explained a specific list cannot be identified because multiple funding sources could become available.

Commissioner Roberts commented that Council could still change priorities. She said stressed the need for more transparency.

Commissioner Ho commented that having a list made it seem that the projects would be done. He said the residents needed to know it could take a long time to get their streets done in the PMP.

12. DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Adabala gave an update on the following:
Northern Parkway

- El Mirage Alternative Access - Complete

New Staff Member

- Randy Proch – Transportation Planning Administrator

13. COMMISSIONER UPDATES

Commissioner Ho noted there was one public comment at the Right of Way Landscape Project meeting, asking who was responsible when a tree falls over and hits a resident's wall.

14. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

No requests made.

15. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission will be held on Thursday, November 2, 2023 at 6:00 p.m.

16. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Joyce adjourned the meeting at 8:36 p.m.

The Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting minutes of September 7, 2023 were submitted and approved this 5th day of October 2023.

Yunpei Zhang, Recording Secretary

Robert Cruz, of the Yucca District, commented on Bond Question #1.

He said the question was represented as a specific list of items, such as how the bond would be spent. However, at an informational meeting he attended last week, it was announced that the projects on the list were just examples. He felt this was a bait and switch in the bond pamphlet. He said the bonds were unsecured and if the housing market took a crash, the City could go into default. He asked why the citizens were being asked for this money since there were general funds that could be used. He said the bond information says it was not likely to raise property taxes, but there were instances where it could be raised. He felt like the matter was misrepresented and he did not trust Question #1.

Helena Johnson-Bodine, of the Cholla District, said that she lives in the Arrowhead area and effluent water is used in the medians, which causes challenges.

She said she attended a Transportation Meeting on September 25th at the Foothills Recreation Center on the Right of Way Landscaping at which it was announced there would be a change from using effluent water to potable water in those projects. She asked why this was being done and if there was a cost savings.

Erin Cole, of the Sahuaro District, provided a comment sheet:

Good evening,

My name is Erin Cole. I live in the Sahuaro district.

I am here tonight, again, to speak about CUP 23-04, Stay APT extended stay proposed to be built at 7300 W. Camino San Xavier.

Since my public comment in September, this CUP was heard before the P&Z Commission, and UNANIMOUSLY voted down as the project "does not fit" with surrounding businesses and residential area; it does not meet the required findings.

I thank you for allowing this topic to be on your agenda tonight, though I am concerned for this process. I did my research on behalf of the citizens, and the City, frankly. I followed the process, came and spoke publicly, asked the City to conduct their own traffic study, and allow this CUP to be on the next agenda.

I am very concerned about the forced inaction of this Commission by City Staff and Legal informing me that "no action can be taken". Again, for the record, this proposed CUP is on a PRIVATELY OWNED street. How can the City collectively (this commission, Staff, and/or Legal) endorse a brand new commercial building without conducting any research with regard to traffic congestion, unsafe pedestrian traffic, lack of sidewalks, no plan or even room for sidewalks, lack of street lighting, a blind curve in the road, documented traffic diverting into parking lots to avoid a stop sign, a one-way pork chop into the proposed driveway, has zero street maintenance, and the potential for overflow parking into surrounding businesses and neighborhoods? This is absolutely a qualifying topic for this Commission. Further, this Commission should be REQUIRED to conduct an independent study, personally visit the site, agendize the topic, and provide a recommendation to Council.

I have enclosed my correspondence with City Staff to be added to the record tonight.

I am thankful for your time, and will be glad to answer any questions as this is a "discussion item".