



DRAFT MINUTES

**CITIZENS TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMISSION
TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT OFFICE
6210 W. MYRTLE AVE., BUILDING A, SUITE 111/112
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**JANUARY 4, 2024
6:00P.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Marsh called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m.
He announced that Chair Joyce would arrive shortly.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Bryon Joyce, Chair
Paul Marsh, Vice Chair
Norma Cuevas, Commissioner
James Ho, Commissioner
Tiana Roberts, Commissioner

Absent: Marc Floyd, Commissioner

Also Present: Purab Adabala , Transportation Deputy Director
Kevin Link, Transit Administrator
Randy Proch, Transportation Planning Administrator
Tom Quigley, Transportation Program Manager
Russ Romney, Assistant City Attorney
Yunpei Zhang, Transportation Planner
Todd Blair, Supervisor Facilities Maintenance, Field Operations

3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA - WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES

Approval of the agenda for the January 4, 2024 Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission (CTOC) meeting. *For discussion and action.*

Motioned by Commissioner Tiana Roberts, seconded by Commissioner James Ho

AYE: Chair Bryon Joyce
Vice Chair Paul Marsh
Commissioner Norma Cuevas
Commissioner James Ho

Commissioner Tiana Roberts
Other: Commissioner Marc Floyd (ABSENT)
Passed

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

Approval of the minutes from the October 5, 2023 CTOC meeting. *For discussion and action.*

Motioned by Commissioner James Ho, seconded by Commissioner Tiana Roberts

AYE: Chair Bryon Joyce
Vice Chair Paul Marsh
Commissioner James Ho
Commissioner Tiana Roberts
Other: Commissioner Marc Floyd (ABSENT)
Commissioner Norma Cuevas (ABSTAIN)
Passed

5. CITIZEN COMMENTS

None.

6. TRANSIT PROJECT STATUS UPDATES - NORTH PARK & RIDE AND THE BUS STOP ADVERTISING PROJECTS

Mr. Quigley gave a presentation on the North Park & Ride, which included information on the following:

- Funding Resources
- Current Status - Design Phase
- Possible use of solar panels on canopies
- Possible installation of 2 EV Charging Stations
- Original cost estimation
- Map of current Park & Ride locations
- Arial view of the Park & Ride FRAC location
- FRAC Park & Ride layout diagram

Vice Chair Marsh asked if there will be express busses to (Foothills Recreation and Aquatics Center (FRAC)). Mr. Link said there was already one express bus route serving FRAC.

Commissioner Roberts asked if staff could explore installing covered bike lockers at the Park & Ride, as it was along a bike route. Mr. Link said this could be explored.

Chair Joyce asked for the full project estimate, including solar and EV charging stations. Mr. Link said that the cost for the solar or EV stations was yet to be determined. Mr. Link noted that the City Manager was very interested in installing EV charging stations throughout the City.

Vice Chair Marsh asked if the solar would be used for the EV charging stations. Mr. Link said that solar would be used for the FRAC and for power lighting underneath the canopies.

Commissioner Roberts commented that there was one egress at the site, which gets busy. Mr. Link said there was intent to knock out some of the wall and install shelters and benches.

Commissioner Ho asked if there would be any security cameras. Mr. Link said that was correct.

Commissioner Ho asked why FRAC was selected over the Arrowhead Towne Center location. Mr. Quigley said the City owns the FRAC property. Mr. Link explained the City was renting the site on the Dream City Church property and the church no longer wanted to rent nor sell the property. Mr. Link said there was enough space at the FRAC and it made sense.

Commissioner Cuevas asked if there was a lot of usage at Arrowhead. Mr. Link said there was probably more usage, however, it was hard to get a true count because some of the drivers could have been patrons and not using the express bus.

Commissioner Ho asked if the Arrowhead Park & Ride would be discontinued. Mr. Adabala said that was correct.

Mr. Quigley continued the presentation on the Bus Stop Advertising Program, which included the following information:

- Bus Stop locations identified for advertising in Phase I
- Construction completion for the first kiosk/panel in the Westgate area
- Current occupancy
- Program revenue
- Photos of kiosks/panels and wraps

Commissioner Ho asked if there was a minimum annual guarantee on the contract. Mr. Link said there was not on the first year, but possibly the City could get a minimum annual guarantee on years two, three, and four.

Vice Chair Marsh inquired about the amount of interest to advertise. Mr. Link said interest started out pretty good, however, winter has been a slower time. Mr. Link noted that the initial response was better than expected.

Vice Chair Marsh asked if companies who were advertising were local or otherwise. Mr. Link said it was mainly local companies.

7. DRAFT BUDGET FOR FY2024 - FY2025

Mr. Adabala gave an update on the Draft Budget for FY2024-25, which included information on the following:

- Organization and Mission
- Budget Process
- FY2025-2034 Capital Improvement Program (CIP)
- FY2025 Operating Budget
- FY2025 Budget Calendar

Commissioner Ho asked if there would be supplementals for the voice switch, as was discussed at the Airport tour.

Mr. Adabala said there are three voice switches, but two were not functional. He said the order was placed two months ago as it was an emergency and contingency funds were used for the current fiscal year. He explained the order will arrive in June or July, due to the eight-month lead time.

Commissioner Roberts asked when CTOC could provide recommendations on the 10-Year CIP. Mr. Adabala said that could be done at anytime.

Commissioner Ho asked if CTOC hosted hearings for public input on the budget. Mr. Adabala said Council hosts the public hearings. Mr. Romney was not sure if the CTOC could host a public hearing. Commissioner Ho recalled it was allowed by the CTOC ordinance and Commissioner Roberts concurred. Commissioner Ho noted that public comments were not allowed at Council workshops, so if CTOC had a hearing, it could obtain public comments to send to Council.

Vice Chair Marsh requested receipt of budget materials sooner, for more effective input. Mr. Adabala explained, based on the budget process timeline, this was the soonest time the materials could have been provided.

Vice Chair Marsh inquired about a line item for Active Transportation Grants. Mr. Adabala cited the line item for Bike Projects / Local Match and said this was the set aside for a local match for potential grants.

Commissioner Roberts asked about the 10-year CIP, she addressed intersections along 59th Ave should have a placeholder within the program. Mr. Adabala explained Proposition 479 which is the extension, 59th Ave is included in Proposition 479 for those intersections. If valid measure passes, the regional funding will pay for the projects, so we wouldn't have to do anything about CIP funding, unless it is a matching fund.

Mr. Romney announced, upon review, that there was a provision in the ordinance for hosting a public hearing and provided the requirements.

Commissioner Ho asked if staff could coordinate a public hearing or another way to obtain public comment to forward to CTOC. Vice Chair Marsh noted that historically, public turnout has been low at those types of meetings. Commissioner Ho said it was good practice to provide opportunity for the public to make comments. Mr. Adabala said there was a public hearing, but it was at the Council voting meeting. Vice Chair Marsh suggested allowing the public to submit comments online. Mr. Adabala said staff will look into the software that would be necessary to do so.

Discussion was held regarding the list of CIP projects to be provided to the public and the importance to not impart to the public that the projects would all move forward, as the budget was a draft only.

Vice Chair Marsh asked about the Deputy Director position for the department. Mr. Adabala explained the recruitment history and said recruitment would resume. Vice Chair Marsh asked if the position was in the budget. Mr. Adabala said that was correct.

8. CTOC BYLAW UPDATE

Mr. Proch gave a CTOC Bylaw Update, which included the following information:

- 2002 Uniform Bylaws
 - The mission remains unchanged.
 - The powers, duties, and responsibilities are unchanged.
- The Bylaw regarding the appointment of committees has changed.
 - Ordinance 22-32 replaces the CTOC bylaws and it states: Public bodies may not create, appoint, or authorize any subcommittees or working groups unless specifically authorized in the resolution or ordinance creating the public body.

9. FY2023 GLENDALE ONBOARD PROGRAM ANNUAL REPORT - DRAFT

Ms. Zhang gave a presentation on the FY2023 Glendale Onboard Program Annual Report, which included information on the following:

- Proposition 402
- Role of CTOC
- Financial Summary
- Map of Projects and Programs Using Sales Tax Funds in FY2023

Commissioner Ho asked when the audit on the report would take place. Mr. Adabala said the audit should be started soon and a presentation would be given to CTOC.

Commissioner Ho suggested tabling the agenda item for further review of the report. Mr. Adabala confirmed tabling the agenda item would not hold up any part of the process.

ACTION BY CTOC: To table agenda item 9, FY2023 GLENDALE ONBOARD PROGRAM ANNUAL REPORT – DRAFT, until the CTOC meeting on February 1, 2024.

Motioned by Commissioner James Ho, seconded by Commissioner Tiana Roberts

AYE: Chair Bryon Joyce
Vice Chair Paul Marsh
Commissioner Norma Cuevas
Commissioner James Ho
Commissioner Tiana Roberts
Other: Commissioner Marc Floyd (ABSENT)
Passed

10. DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Adabala gave an update on the following:
Northern Parkway

- Update on Re-scoping Projects

Other Projects

- Loop 101: 75th Ave to I-17
- SS4A Grant
 - Vision Zero
 - Safety Action Plan
- Transportation Plan
- Active Transportation Plan
 - Potential SS4A Grant Submittal

11. COMMISSIONER UPDATES

Chair Joyce announced that Commissioner Floyd resigned from the CTOC for 2024 and this was his last meeting on the Commission.

12. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Roberts requested a background on light rail and the City's current stance on light rail expansion.

Commission Ho requested information on how the streets will be selected in the GO Bond Program improvements.

13. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission will be held on February 1, 2024 at 6:00 p.m.

14. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Joyce adjourned the meeting at 7:56 p.m.

The Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting minutes of January 4, 2024 were submitted and approved this 1st day of February 2024.

Yunpei Zhang, Recording Secretary