



**DRAFT MINUTES**

**CITIZENS TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMISSION  
TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT OFFICE  
6210 W. MYRTLE AVE., BUILDING A, SUITE 111/112  
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**MARCH 7, 2024  
6:00 P.M.**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Vice Chair Marsh called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

**2. ROLL CALL**

Commissioner Nguyen announced that he has a legal name change from February and his last name is now Nguyen.

Present: Paul Marsh, Vice Chair  
Norma Cuevas, Commissioner  
Neil Lynch, Commissioner  
James Nguyen, Commissioner  
Tiana Roberts, Commissioner

Absent: Bryon Joyce, Chair

Also Present: Purab Adabala, Transportation Deputy Director  
Randy Proch, Transportation Planning Administrator  
Russ Romney, Deputy City Attorney  
Yunpei Zhang, Transportation Planner

**3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA - WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES**

**ACTION BY CTOC:** Approval of the agenda for the March 7, 2024 Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission.

Motioned by Commissioner Tiana Roberts, seconded by Commissioner Neil Lynch

AYE: Vice Chair Paul Marsh  
Commissioner Norma Cuevas  
Commissioner Neil Lynch  
Commissioner James Nguyen  
Commissioner Tiana Roberts

Other: Chair Bryon Joyce (ABSENT)

Passed

**4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES**

Mr. Nguyen mentioned that Mr. Romney's title needs to be corrected on the previous Minutes.

Ms. Cuevas mentioned that if she needs to vote even if she was absent last meeting. Mr. Proch explained that the Ms. Cuevas must vote. The City Attorney stated that a Commissioner can only abstain from a vote if there is a clear conflict of interest. Mr. Proch relayed that the City Clerk also provided guidance and informed staff that not being present at a meeting was not a conflict of interest. He said this was a new procedure and the vote must be cast.

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the minutes from the February 1, 2024 meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission, as written.

Motioned by Commissioner Neil Lynch, seconded by Commissioner James Nguyen

AYE: Vice Chair Paul Marsh  
Commissioner Norma Cuevas  
Commissioner Neil Lynch  
Commissioner James Nguyen  
Commissioner Tiana Roberts  
Other: Chair Bryon Joyce (ABSENT)  
Passed

**5. CITIZEN COMMENTS**

Ms. Zhang announced there were no citizens present and there were no comments.

**6. FORMER LIGHT RAIL PLANS**

Mr. Proch provide a presentation on the Former Light Rail Plans, which included the following information on light rail transit in the Phoenix metropolitan area from 2001-2024, including the brief history in Glendale from 2001-2017, and future expansion studies in the city of Phoenix starting in 2026 and beyond.

Mr. Nguyen asked what was the driver of the 70% increase over the higher numbers. Mr. Adabala answered that this is an upgraded number we received from Valley Metro. The original project was on Glendale Avenue with a 5-mile corridor, which included 2 miles in Glendale and 3 miles in Phoenix. The new alignment takes Camelback Road and 43<sup>rd</sup> Avenue to Glendale Avenue to Downtown, making it a 7-mile corridor. Thus, this would explain the cost and cost per mile by Valley Metro, all those factors make the number higher.

Ms. Roberts mentioned that the extension route will go to Desert Sky and she recalled she read from the Valley Metro site, that they are in the study phase at the moment. Mr. Proch agreed with Ms. Roberts and talked about how some studies can turn into construction projects and some may not.

Ms. Roberts addressed the light rail project was initially voter-approved back in 2001, they went through CTOC to get approved then went to Council Workshop, and the Council decided to go to a different option. She understands the 7-mile corridor increased the cost and she mentioned we see that based on the past eight years how much light rail can impact tourism specifically, she used the Diamondbacks games as an example of the public's interest in using light rail for events. She also stated that light rail helps students to school, gets employees to work, and lead tourists to destinations. She stated there is an opportunity for a light rail route

extending from the future Desert Sky light rail stop to Westgate, and then eventually to the Glendale airport. A portion of this potential extension would be in Phoenix and a portion in Glendale. Glendale would then get the benefits of a light rail connection. She encourages staff to conduct a study of this possible future extension option. She understands this is longer term planning, but can we do some studies or get a placeholder ten years out in the CIP. Mr. Proch mentioned that staff will work with our regional partners to see where Phoenix is at for their studies, and see what can be possibly done. Mr. Proch iterated that staff does not have a position on the matter, only to get any opinions from the members, Commissioner can direct staff to explore this further.

Mr. Marsh mentioned before Council's vote for the Light Rail, he contacted his Councilmember and expressed his disappointment for their potential decision. The Councilmember mentioned to Mr. Marsh that he was the only person who contacted her about Light Rail in her entire district. He recalled members from CTOC were very disappointed. Mr. Marsh mentioned he had a chance to talk with the Mayor informally a few years ago but did not get positive feedback. Mr. Marsh also said it seems to him that some of the CTOC members think it's a great idea whether the light rail goes the old route up north or goes through the I-10 and that either way there is a lot of benefit from this.

Mr. Nguyen asked if the Council had expressed any interest in exploring light rail since the vote from the last resolution. Mr. Proch and Mr. Adabala answered they did not hear any discussion about this whatsoever.

Ms. Roberts addressed she understood staff are bringing the CIP back to the Commission for action. Mr. Nguyen mentioned he has requested CIP as a possible action item for the next meeting, he mentioned there was a discussion about the amount of the transit investment to the CIP at Council Workshop, if staff can help address that. Mr. Adabala answered yes.

Mr. Nguyen stated CTOC can't go at this alone without the Council's support. Ms. Roberts mentioned the longer-term plan, almost to provide a seed of opportunity for several years down the line. Mr. Proch mentioned that the City is actively looking to have a long-range Transportation Plan. Mr. Adabala stated that the staff will bring the item to the Commission on a future date as an agenda item. Mr. Proch mentioned that all forms of transportation will be studied along with the long-range Transportation Master Plan efforts, which can include regional studies with partner agencies.

## **7. 2024 CTOC GOAL SETTING**

Mr. Proch gave a presentation on the 2024 CTOC Goal Setting, which included the following information:

- Ensure Public Input and Government Accountability
- Monitor the Glendale Onboard (GO) Fund Expenditures
- Approve the GO Program of Projects
- Advise on other transportation matters

Mr. Nguyen asked does the City Council take action on our report if the board supports the item to City Council for action. Mr. Proch mentioned that we had this discussion with City Attorney Mr. Romney, each of the action items was handled in the same manner, like this meeting is recorded which is the mechanism to send the City Council. Mr. Nguyen asked if our meeting was part of the agenda packet, and Mr. Proch answered he didn't think so. Ms. Roberts said this is not a formal action item. Mr. Proch mentioned to our knowledge, there is not an action item.

Mr. Proch stated that this information is relayed through the City Clerk. Ms. Roberts asked where would this information be found. Mr. Adabala stated that the minutes are posted on the

website. Mr. Proch asked City Attorney what is the next step on some of these next items. Mr. Romney stated that if CTOC wants City Council to take formal action they can make a formal recommendation to the Council but they do not have to accept, they can take action if they want to. Mr. Romney mentioned that whatever recommendations CTOC made to the Council on record after they review the program because the Minutes will be covered and forwarded to City Clerk's Office. They can make the recommendation for Minutes to send to the Council straightly as well, but Council might decide to not include them on the agenda.

Mr. Nguyen mentioned that if the Goal is from the Ordinance to the City Council for action. Ms. Roberts said this is an action item if the Commission cannot change anything because it is from the Ordinance what is the reason for this item on the agenda as an action item. Mr. Proch mentioned that the annual GO Report is required for review as Ordinance state. Mr. Romney state if Council decided not to bring the item to the agenda, that is still an action. He suggests tabling the matter and bringing it to the next meeting if Commissioners want. Mr. Proch reiterated that the goal-setting process is required annually, and the information presented matches with the corresponding Ordinance.

**ACTION BY CTOC:** Support the 2024 CTOC Goals as written and recommend moving it forward to the Council.

Motioned by Commissioner Neil Lynch, seconded by Commissioner Norma Cuevas

AYE: Vice Chair Paul Marsh  
Commissioner Norma Cuevas  
Commissioner Neil Lynch  
Commissioner James Nguyen  
Commissioner Tiana Roberts  
Other: Chair Bryon Joyce (ABSENT)  
Passed

## **8. DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Mr. Adabala gave an update on the following:

- Long-Range Transportation Plan
- 75th Avenue Pedestrian Improvements
- RAISE Grant
- SS4A (Vision Zero and Safety Action Plan)
- Pedestrian Improvement South

## **9. COMMISSIONER UPDATES**

Commissioners will share information obtained from a variety of sources including other boards and committees, transportation-related public meetings and informal discussions with citizens. *For information and discussion.*

## **10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Commissioner Nguyen requested that the Draft CIP be brought back to the Commission for possible action .

## **11. NEXT MEETING**

The next regular meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission will be held on Thursday, April 4, 2024 at 6:00 p.m.

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

**Vice Chair Marsh adjourned the meeting at 6:55 p.m.**

The Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting minutes of March 7, 2024 were submitted and approved this 4th day of April, 2024.

---

Yunpei Zhang  
Recording Secretary