



DRAFT MINUTES

**CITIZENS TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMISSION
TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT OFFICE
6210 W. GLENDALE AVE. BUILDING A, SUITE 111/112
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**APRIL 4, 2024
6:00P.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Marsh called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

Vice Chair Marsh announced that our transcriptionist, Denise Kazmierczak, passed away on March 15, 2024 and expressed appreciation for her service to the CTOC and the other boards and commissions she served.

Vice Chair Marsh also announced that staff received an email from Chair Joyce stating that he has resigned from the CTOC. Vice Chair Marsh expressed the CTOC's appreciation for Chair Joyce's participation in the commission.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Paul Marsh, Vice Chair
Neil Lynch, Commissioner
James Nguyen, Commissioner
Tiana Roberts, Commissioner

Absent: Norma Cuevas, Commissioner

Also Present: Purab Adabala, Transportation Deputy Director
Randy Proch, Transportation Planning Administrator
Russ Romney, Deputy City Attorney
Yunpei Zhang, Transportation Planner

3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA - WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the agenda for the April 4, 2024 Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission.

Commissioner Nguyen stated that he requested during the last meeting that the Transportation CIP projects be brought back to the CTOC for possible action, and noticed that tonight's agenda identified it as an item for information and discussion only (Agenda Item 7). Mr. Romney informed the commission that the CIP has already been submitted to Council. Commissioner Roberts mentioned that CTOC can still make a recommendation to Council regarding the submitted CIP projects, but that potential action is not permitted with this meeting's agenda because the item is only

“for information and discussion.” Commissioner Nguyen asked if the CTOC can vote to change Agenda Item 7 to an actionable item. Mr. Romney stated that the commission cannot change the agenda at this time due to open meeting laws requiring that any such change is required to be posted 24 hours in advance of the meeting. Commissioner Nguyen asked what the changes commissioners can make at the Approval of the Agenda item that is included at each meeting. Commissioner Roberts mentioned that the commission may rearranged agenda items and postpone items. Mr. Romney added that public comments may be added in front of the items as well. Mr. Adabala mentioned that he has information on the Transportation CIP projects item that will be part of the Agenda Item 7 discussion, and commissioners agreed to hear that information at that time. Vice Chair Marsh added that the commission can identify the need to add this item to the next meeting agenda as an action item if desired after Agenda Item 7 is presented.

Motioned by Commissioner Neil Lynch, seconded by Vice Chair Paul Marsh

AYE: Vice Chair Paul Marsh
Commissioner Neil Lynch
Commissioner James Nguyen
Commissioner Tiana Roberts
Other: Commissioner Norma Cuevas (ABSENT)
Passed

4. *APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

Approval of the minutes from the March 7, 2024 CTOC meeting. *For information and action.*

Motioned by Commissioner James Nguyen, seconded by Commissioner Tiana Roberts

AYE: Vice Chair Paul Marsh
Commissioner Neil Lynch
Commissioner James Nguyen
Commissioner Tiana Roberts
Other: Commissioner Norma Cuevas (ABSENT)
Passed

5. CITIZEN COMMENTS

Ms. Zhang announced there were no citizens present and there were no comments.

6. *PAVEMENT MANAGEMENT PROGRAM UPDATE

Mr. Gurrola provided an update on the status of the Pavement Management Program (PMP), including the status of the FY2024 activities and the work planned for FY 2025.

Commissioner Roberts asked if crack sealing is considered a surface treatment. Mr. Gurrola answered it is a pre-treatment, and explained that it is included when surface treatments such as slurry sealing are implemented. Mr. Gurrola described additional pre-treatment measures. Ms. Roberts asked if the pre-treatment could be done years in advance. Mr. Gurrola answered it is usually performed a minimum of three months in advance of the full surface treatment, and Glendale’s planning and budget process keeps the pre-treatment within the same fiscal year as the surface treatment.

Commissioner Nguyen asked Mr. Gurrola to describe the methodology for identifying treatment types and scheduling for upcoming fiscal years. Mr. Gurrola explained that the Pavement Management Program is a ten-year program primarily based on periodic pavement condition surveys, performed by a consultant, that assign a Pavement Condition Index (PCI) score, and available budget.

Mr. Adabala mentioned it is a modeling exercise that determines how quickly pavement condition target goals can be met based on how much funding is allocated to the program.

Commissioner Nguyen mentioned that the presentation identified 54 miles of roadway with a failing PCI and requiring reconstruction, but only 2.5 miles are identified for reconstruction in the upcoming fiscal year. He inquired about the process for deciding where reconstruction projects are prioritized within the entire 10-year program. Mr. Adabala explained that the program needs to balance the reconstruction projects with the other program pavement activities, so that the most needed reconstructions can be prioritized each year while still providing appropriate treatments on the rest of the network to maintain good pavement condition overall. He also explained that the current average PCI score for all roadways in the City is 58, and if the program is followed it is expected that the average PCI score will increase to 70 in 10 years.

Commissioner Roberts mentioned a local news story about a pavement preservation system called EZ Patcher by Crafcoc that claims to be safer for the crews. Mr. Adabala mentioned Glendale uses some Crafcoc products and explained that the department is continually evaluating new products, equipment and processes that might be more efficient and cost effective. However, not all the products and equipment are conducive to the type and scale of work required for Glendale's pavement activities.

Commissioner Nguyen asked if more arterials will be reconstructed with concrete as opposed to asphalt and cited the recent Glendale Avenue reconstruction as an example. Mr. Gurrola responded that it is not the current plan and explained that Glendale Avenue represents a unique case due to the high volume of heavy truck traffic related to the landfill, mining operations, and recent developments in the area. Mr. Adabala mentioned the using multiple pavement types (meaning both concrete and asphalt) can pose additional challenges for maintenance activities and city utility repairs. However, specific location situations may dictate the consideration to use concrete instead of asphalt, and would be considered on the needs of the Transportation Department and recommendations from other city departments.

Commissioner Nguyen asked if it is cheaper to maintain the concrete. Mr. Gurrola explained that it is typically more expensive to construct and less expensive to maintain. Mr. Adabala added that concrete is more complicated to design and does require some additional maintenance care, which if not performed can result in expensive replacement costs compared to asphalt.

7. DRAFT CIP PROJECTS

Mr. Adabala presented information on the draft CIP projects and the CIP budget process and schedule.

Commissioner Roberts asked if 10-Year Program will be coming back to CTOC in a few months. Mr. Adabala answered yes, and explained that recommending the 10-Year Program is one CTOC's primary responsibilities. Commissioner Roberts asked if that will be an action item. Mr. Adabala answered that is correct and that staff will provide a draft for commissioners to review prior to asking for the recommendation action. Vice Chair Marsh requested that the commissioners be made more aware of the deadlines to ensure the opportunity for more timely CTOC input. Commissioner Roberts mentioned that recommending the 10-Year Program to Council is in an ordinance requirement for CTOC. Mr. Adabala agreed.

Commissioner Roberts asked if the audit survey went out that CTOC were discussing a couple months ago. Mr. Adabala said the Department did post the Transportation CIP projects on the Transportation Department website. Mr. Proch showed the Commission how to access the information from the City of Glendale main webpage, and informed the commission that as of the prior week staff had not received any comments. Commissioner Roberts suggested posting the link on Nextdoor, and Mr. Adabala agreed that staff would do so.

Commissioner Marsh asked if Council is aware that the Transportation CIP public comment webpage is available. Mr. Adabala stated the webpage link was not specifically sent to Council, but Council makes the entire budget book available during the annual budget process. Commissioner Roberts mentioned that Commissioner Marsh made a good point and Council members have weekly newsletters where

this link could be provided.

Commissioner Nguyen expressed that the Transportation CIP projects webpage is a great resource for residents to provide feedback, giving the public the ability to make comments on how their money is being spent. Mr. Adabala mentioned that this is a new feature and the next time staff will have more experience in providing this resource. Commissioner Nguyen expressed hope that other City departments will provide similar access and commenting opportunity for their CIP projects. Mr. Adabala mentioned all the Pavement Management Program projects are posted on the department website, and all the City's 10-year CIP projects are posted on the City website.

Commissioner Roberts requested a future agenda item where staff can share the comments received via the Transportation CIP projects webpage.

8. DEPUTY DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Adabala gave an update on the following:

- 63rd Avenue Pedestrian Bridge
- INFRA grant
- SS4A (Active Transportation Plan and ADA Transition Plan)
- 67th Avenue Phase I and Phase II

9. COMMISSION UPDATES

Vice Chair Marsh mentioned that the Glendale Family Bike Ride is coming up and he encouraged commissioners to participate in this event. He also informed commissioners that ADOT is holding a virtual public meeting about improvements to Loop 303 which includes a proposed new interchange at 67th Avenue that may impact Glendale's transportation network. He encouraged commissioners to attend and share the information to whomever may be interested.

10. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Roberts requested that on future agendas the Deputy Director's Report be posted for information and discussion, and not just for information. Commissioner Nguyen asked if the topics presented in the report can be discussed if the Report item is posted for information and discussion. Mr. Romney answered yes, as long as the topics are within the scope of the ordinance. Mr. Adabala explained that the restriction on discussions initially came at the direction of the City office that oversees the boards and commissions, because the topics are not individually identified on the agenda. He mentioned that staff will soon participate in a boards and commissions training and will request information on this issue at that time. Commissioner Roberts asked whether discussion on the Deputy Director's report may occur until clarification from the boards and commission office is received. Mr. Adabala stated that apparently it can.

Commissioner Nguyen inquired about the running list of future agenda items and wondered if those topics have been exhausted. Mr. Proch explained that staff is regularly tracking the CTOC agenda items and the list still has many topics to be addressed during future meetings. He mentioned that it is staff's intent that CTOC meet regularly every month to avoid overly long meetings and to keep the agenda interesting and topics moving. Vice Chair Marsh requested that the current list be presented to the CTOC during the next meeting. Mr. Proch proposed instead that staff will send the list out immediately and commissioners can email feedback regarding what items they would like to see prioritized, and those results can be discussed at the next meeting instead of going over the entire list. He offered that commissioners are welcome to reach out to staff individually to discuss any of the potential agenda items.

11. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission will be held on Thursday, May 2, 2024 at 6:00 p.m.

12. ADJOURNMENT

Vice Chair Marsh adjourned the meeting at 7:01 p.m.

The Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission meeting minutes of April 4, 2024 were submitted and approved this 6th day of June 2024.

Patrick Sage
Recording Secretary