



MINUTES

**PLANNING COMMISSION
GLENDALE CIVIC CENTER
5750 W. GLENN DRIVE
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**FEBRUARY 22, 2024
6:00 P.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Crow called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Vern Crow, Chair
Edwin Nyberg, Vice Chair
Tom Cole, Commissioner
John Crow, Commissioner
John Geurs, Commissioner
Martin Nowakowski, Commissioner
Bryan Hooper, Commissioner

Also Present: Tabitha Perry, Deputy Director, Development Services
James Gruber, Chief Deputy, City Attorney
Evan Evangelopoulos, Senior Planner
Tawanda Walker-Hall, Administrative Support Supervisor

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

- a.** Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of December 14, 2023.
Chairperson Crow called for a motion to approve the minutes of the December 14, 2023, meeting minutes.

AYE: Chair Vern Crow
Vice Chair Edwin Nyberg
Commissioner Tom Cole
Commissioner John Crow
Commissioner John Geurs
Commissioner Martin Nowakowski
Commissioner Bryan Hooper

Passed

4. WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES

There were none.

5. PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

1. GPA23-03 & ZON23-05: A request by Jordan Greenman with Greenman Law Firm, for a Minor General Plan Amendment from Low Density Residential (LDR 2.5, 1 – 2.5 dwelling units per acre) to Medium Density Residential (MDR 3.5, 2.5 - 3.5 dwelling units per acre) and a rezoning from A-1 (Agricultural) to R1-8, Single Family Residential, to allow for a three-lot single family development. The site is at 7448 North 83rd Avenue and is located on the northwest side of the intersection of Orangewood and 83rd Avenues in the Yucca District.

Presented by: Evan Evangelopoulos, Senior Planner

Chairperson Crow called for public hearing items GPA23-03 & ZON23-05. Stated items will be voted on separately.

Senior Planner, Evan Evangelopoulos gave a presentation on GPA23-03 & ZON23-05 noting stipulations one and two in the presentation were removed.

The applicant, Mr. Flores, gave a presentation.

Chairperson Crow received three (3) speaker cards from residents voicing their concerns about the 2-story homes, property value, and whether units will be rental property or homes for sale.

Mr. Flores addressed residents' concerns by stating his intention regarding how the homes will be built.

Commissioners discussed if additional stipulations could be added.

Deputy Director, Tabitha Perry, voiced caution to Commissioners that the case is a straight zoning request and follows what the regulations allow.

Chairperson Crow closed the public hearing GPA23-03 & ZON23-05.

Motioned by Commissioner Martin Nowakowski, seconded by Vice Chair Edwin Nyberg

AYE: Chair Vern Crow

Vice Chair Edwin Nyberg

Commissioner Tom Cole

Commissioner John Crow

Commissioner John Geurs

Commissioner Martin Nowakowski

Commissioner Bryan Hooper

Passed

Motioned by Commissioner Tom Cole, seconded by Vice Chair Edwin Nyberg

AYE: Chair Vern Crow

Vice Chair Edwin Nyberg

Commissioner Tom Cole

Commissioner John Crow
Commissioner John Geurs
Commissioner Martin Nowakowski
Commissioner Bryan Hooper

Passed

6. OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Perry summarized the Planning Commission goal discussed during the workshop. Chairperson Crow requested a motion and vote to adopt the 2024 Planning Commission goals.

Commissioner Crow motioned to approve.
Commissioner Geurs seconded.
All commissioners vote Aye, motion passes.

7. PLANNING STAFF REPORT

- a. There were none.

8. COMMISSION COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS

There were none.

9. CITIZEN COMMENTS

There were none.

10. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the Planning Commission is scheduled for March 28th at 6:00 p.m., in the Civic Center located at 5750 West Glenn Drive, Glendale, Arizona, 85301.

11. ADJOURNMENT

Motioned by Commissioner Tom Cole, seconded by Commissioner John Geurs

AYE: Chair Vern Crow
Vice Chair Edwin Nyberg
Commissioner Tom Cole
Commissioner John Crow
Commissioner John Geurs
Commissioner Martin Nowakowski
Commissioner Bryan Hooper

Passed

Chairperson Crow adjourned the meeting at 6:31 p.m.

The Planning Commission meeting minutes of February 22, 2024, were submitted and approved the 25th day of April, 2024.

Tawanda Walker-Hall
Recording Secretary



MINUTES

**COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE
GLENDALE CIVIC CENTER
SAPPHIRE ROOM
5750 W. GLENN DR.
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**MARCH 21, 2024
5:30 P.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice-Chair Gallegos called the meeting to order at 6:21 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Moises Gallegos, Vice Chair
Kelly Carbello, Committee Member
David Giles, Committee Member
Brandon Hiller, Committee Member
Carlos Vargas, Committee Member

Absent: Lisa Baker, Chair
Kirstin Flores, Committee Member
Oscar Gonzales, Committee Member
Theodora Hackenberg, Committee Member

Also Present: Matthew Hess, Community Revitalization Administrator
Karen Mofford, Housing Administrator
Trilese DiLeo, Grants Supervisor
Yolanda Poole, Administrative Support Specialist

3. CITIZEN COMMENTS

One public comment about car towing was received via email. Mr. Hess stated he directed the member of the public to the correct department.

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

- a. **Motion by Committee Member Giles, second by Committee Member Carbello, to approve the February 15, 2024 minutes of the Community Development Advisory Committee meeting. The motion carried 5 – 0.**

5. OLD BUSINESS

None.

6. NEW BUSINESS

- a. **Public Hearing #2 - 2024-25 Annual Action Plan and Substantial Plan Amendment**

Mr. Hess called the public hearing to order at 5:32 p.m. The public hearing was held prior to the start of the CDAC meeting.

Mr. Hess stated the purpose of the hearing was to solicit public comment and discussion on the City of Glendale FY2024-25 HUD Annual Action Plan and to discuss proposed allocations and reallocations from prior years of Community Development Block Grant (CDBG), Home Investment Partnerships Program (HOME) Emergency Solutions Grant (ESG) and Neighborhood Stabilization Program (NSP) funding from the US Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD).

Mr. Hess discussed that the City has not received final grant allocation from HUD for FY 2024-25. For planning and discussion purposes the City assumes the following level funding from FY 2023-24.

CDBG: \$2,354,682 HOME: \$775,957

ESG: \$208,142

Total: \$3,338,781

In addition to new FY2024-25 funding, the City will also need to allocate program income to eligible activities. Currently, the City has a total of \$939,048.80 in program income from the following sources:

\$49,572.37 - CDBG;

\$6,334.79 - HOME;

\$821,166.89 - NSP I;

\$61,974.75 - NSP III

Mr. Hess stated the money must be spent to promote or advance the goals outlined in the 2020-24 Annual Action Plan (AAP);

GOAL 1: Promote Access to Decent Affordable Housing

GOAL 2: Increase Access to Homeless Services/ Housing

GOAL 3: Increase Access to Public Services for Vulnerable Populations

GOAL 4: Provide Educational Programs and Business Assistance

GOAL 5: Enhance Livability of Neighborhoods

GOAL 6: Affirmatively Further Fair Housing Regulations

Mr. Hess also stated that under HUD regulations, it is a requirement of communities to complete these amendments under the following circumstances:

- A community wants to add a new activity or delete an existing activity in its entirety; or
- Funding for an existing activity is increased or decreased by 20% or more; or
- If there are substantial changes to the purpose, scope or beneficiaries of an activity.

Mr. Hess went on to discuss the goal of affordable housing as it relates to new rental development, Low-Income Housing Tax Credit Projects (LIHTC), and the recent successes in creating 1,400 units with a total private investment of over \$500 million. The city's participation allows the developers to get the credits they need for those tax credits to leverage the private funding needed to add housing stock to help alleviate the current housing crisis.

Committee Member Vargas inquired about the report's absence of home ownership as presented and asked if there were any initiatives in the current plan to support home ownership.

Mr. Hess responded there were not any current initiatives included to promote home ownership. He stated the city is not obligated to provide a home ownership program. It is considered a potential activity within the goal, but ultimately, if the City determines the needs lie elsewhere, that goal is still acceptable.

Committee Member Vargas inquired who was responsible for the decisions in the report; was it appointed or elected officials?

Mr. Hess responded it is a combination of both staff and elected officials. He welcomed Mr. Vargas's feedback and input in consideration of the City providing a program for home ownership. Mr. Hess also noted any feedback received would be incorporated and discussed with the City Council.

Vice-Chair Gallegos inquired if the lack of a home ownership program was from a lack of funding or what was the history of the decisions made to not have this program.

Mr. Hess responded it changes from year to year depending on the state of the economy. He stated that in today's economy, the cost of single-family homes is so high that the amount of the subsidy would need to be 10's of thousands of dollars and the restrictions on income would preclude most people from qualifying for the program and far fewer people would benefit.

Committee Member Vargas brought up the 300 partners mentioned in the program and referenced Habitat for Humanity and was concerned that proposals are being floated for housing without adequate consideration of parking. He was concerned that a city the size of Glendale does not have a proposal or plan to assist with home ownership.

Mr. Hess agreed that home ownership is a wonderful way to create wealth and stability in low-income communities. He stated that the housing crisis is so dire that the best way to leverage community funds is through rental units. Mr. Hess addressed the parking concern and said developers are required to abide by the city guidelines and ordinances.

Mr. Hess stated that the Housing Voucher program has an element of home ownership and it does exist in the housing choice voucher program. Mr. Hess noted that the Annual Action Plan (AAP) is in draft form and just because a home ownership plan is not included in the draft does not mean it's not important to the community. The document is meant to be an all-inclusive description of the possible needs. It does not obligate the City to allocate money, but prevents the need to have to go back and ask for an amendment to the Consolidated Plan.

Committee Member Carbello asked for home ownership to stay on the table in the goals and somewhere in the plan.

Mr. Hess suggested that something could be agendaized or have a future discussion to

discuss the potential to increase home ownership in the City.

Mr. Hess discussed the reallocation of prior year funds.

Committee Member Carbello stated that she would not support the funds being used for case management for Glendale Works because she feels it is not a jobs program.

Mr. Hess clarified the money for case management would be used to fund Glendale Works Coordinators.

Committee Member Carbello stated that the program was worthy, but she was concerned that the services overlapped with the Glendale Works program. She added she would be happy to see a jobs program in place of the Glendale Works program. She is concerned it does not provide a permanent job or job skills.

Mr. Hess mentioned a workforce program funded by Phoenix Rescue Mission and he would be happy to provide more information about that program at the next meeting. He also mentioned an additional benefit of Glendale Works is that they clean up city properties, including public housing, the landfill, parks and rights of way.

Mr. Hess mentioned all the comments and suggestions would be recorded, considered and put into the draft plan and presented to the council for their decision in April.

Mr. Hess closed the public hearing at 6:20 p.m.

b. Public Hearing: 2024 Annual Housing Plan, Housing Choice Voucher (HCV) Administrative Plan, Admissions and Continued Occupancy Policy (ACOP) Changes, and the Capital Fund Five-Year Plan

Ms. Mofford gave a presentation on the FY2023-24 Annual Housing Plan, Housing Administration and ACOP Changes and Capital Fund Five-Year Plan.

Committee Member Gallegos inquired about general-purpose funding versus HUD funding.

Ms. Mofford clarified that HUD provides all the funding for the City of Glendale public housing.

Committee Member Vargas inquired about the \$20,000 cost for landscaping services and whether the city used a contract.

Ms. Mofford confirmed it was a city contract.

Committee Member Carbello inquired about the \$385,000 cost of repaving parking lots.

Ms. Mofford explained that it had been 10–12 years since the parking lots had been repaved and restriped and it was a needed expenditure.

Committee Member Gallegos inquired about the cost of maintaining City Housing due to the age of the units and the attrition rate.

Ms. Mofford responded that the City of Glendale has 155 units, the attrition rate is about 10%, and the waiting list could last 3–4 years. Ms. Mofford discussed the possibility of HUD repositioning the existing City of Glendale public housing and explained that it's in the 5-year plan, which enables the exploration of new sites and ideas.

Committee Member Carbello followed up with whether the current City of Glendale public housing could become a historic designation.

Ms. Mofford said it had not been discussed, but it could be a possibility.

Ms. Carbello suggested that the city should seek the communities' input when the repositioning reaches the planning stages.

Ms. Mofford stated there would be plenty of opportunities for the community to provide feedback.

Committee Member Vargas also stated he was in favor of exploring the historical value of the Glendale Homes.

Ms. Mofford closed the public hearing at 7:01 p.m.

7. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Hess announced that Denise Kazmierczak, the city's meeting transcriptionist, had passed away. He stated that Denise had worked with the CDAC for several years and that her presence would be missed.

8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS

Committee Member Vargas wanted the minutes to reflect his request for information from the September 21, 2023 CDAC meeting had not been answered.

9. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the Community Development Advisory Committee will be held on April 18th at 5:30 p.m. in the Sapphire Room at the Glendale Civic Center, located at 5750 W. Glenn Dr., Glendale, Arizona, 85301.

10. ADJOURNMENT

Motion by Committee Member Carbello, second by Committee Member Hiller, to adjourn the meeting at 7:03 p.m. Motion carried 5-0.

The Community Development Advisory Committee meeting minutes of March 21, 2024, were submitted and approved on the 18th day of April 2024.

Yolanda Poole
Administrative Support Specialist



City of Glendale

5850 West Glendale Avenue
Glendale, AZ 85301

ARTS COMMISSION MINUTES

March 19, 2024

6:00 PM

Glendale Civic Center Annex
5752 W. Glenn Dr.
Glendale, AZ 85301

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Lenox called the meeting to order at 6:07 PM.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Nancy Lenox, Chair
James Smith, Vice Chair
Jose Aguinaga, Commissioner
Anne Marie Chaney, Commissioner
Dalaina Hand, Commissioner
Paige Hyde, Commissioner

Absent: Derrell Barber, Commissioner

Also Present: Chris Taylor, Arts & Culture Administrator
Jessi Pederson, Director, Economic Development
Daniel Sabillon, Deputy Director, Economic Development

3. CITIZEN COMMENTS

No Comments were received.

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

a. Arts Commission Minutes of February 20, 2024

Motioned by Vice Chair James Smith, seconded by Commissioner Jose Aguinaga To approve the Arts Commission minutes of February 20, 2024 with an amendment to update the minutes with two date changes (Feb. 21 was incorrectly written in two areas, and has since been updated to the correct date of Feb. 20, 2024)

AYE: Chair Nancy Lenox
Vice Chair James Smith
Commissioner Jose Aguinaga

Commissioner Anne Marie Chaney

Commissioner Dalaina Hand

Commissioner Paige Hyde

Passed

5. NEW BUSINESS

a) INFORMATION: Update on Current Projects

Staff will give a progress report of current projects.

Mr. Sabillon and Mr. Taylor brought the commission up to speed on completed projects including Folk and Heritage Festival, LIVE at the Lot, Arts and Culture Festival, and Thunderbird Field.

b) Action: Approval of Grant Guidelines for the 24/25 Performing Arts Grants

Mr. Sabillon guided the commissioners through updates and changes to the 24/25 guidelines, including...

Mr. Sabillon and Mr. Taylor presenting only those applications to the Commissioners that meet the requirements of the grant.

An increase of the funding for the FY 24/25 Performing Arts Grants to \$60,000.

Discussions of the Grant Guidelines included...

Who is eligible to apply? (Any organization can apply so long as they perform in Glendale)

(Asked by Commissioner Paige Hyde)

Any unexpected funds not spent must be returned? Language was changed to "unexpended".

(Asked by Chair Nancy Lennox)

Increasing the Grant Cycle beyond the confines of the Fiscal Year. The city is not obligated to end this specific program June 30. We are able to extend the grant cycle through August 31, 2025. The Grant Cycle used to start October 1 – June 30. This did not allow any summer programs. The goal is to allow programs to produce Sept. 1 – Aug. 31. We are looking to open the application window April 1 – May 30, 2024. (Asked by Director Jessi Pederson)

How much money per organization is available? (\$4000). (Asked by Director Jessi Pederson)

What was the average requested amount of funds per project? (\$4000) (Asked by Vice Chair James Smith)

Can organizations within the city request for additional funding vs. organizations outside Glendale? The recommendation was to look at the exact organizations that receive funding for 2024/25, and then re-visit this question for 2025/26 funding. (Asked by Commissioner Paige Hyde)

Any dates that say June 30 should be changed to August 31. (Updated to the Commission by Chair Nancy Lennox)

Motioned by Commissioner Paige Hyde, seconded by Commissioner Dalaina Hand Motion: To review and approve the Grant Guidelines with the caveat of changing the word "unexpected" to "unused" funds must be returned to the City of Glendale, and with caveat of extending the Grant through August 31, 2025.

AYE: Chair Nancy Lennox

Vice Chair James Smith

Commissioner Jose Aguinaga

Commissioner Anne Marie Chaney

Commissioner Dalaina Hand

Commissioner Paige Hyde

Passed

6. STAFF REPORTS

a. Mr. Sabillon reported on the following:

- Thanking the commission for their involvement.
- An update of the Arts Master Plan is coming at the next meeting.
- Performing Arts grants that were approved for this current fiscal year are still available to attend. Examples include: One Step Beyond (March 23), and Mill Avenue Chamber Players (March 28).
- Commitment to increasing communication with the Commissioners.

7. COMMISSION COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS

- Where can citizens find to look for Performing Arts Grant performances? (Asked by Commissioner Anne Marie Chaney)
- Can the commissioners get e-mail reminders of Performing Arts Grant Performances? (Asked by Vice Chair James Smith)
- Reaffirm our commitment to communicating more with the Arts Commission about these performing arts programs.
- How does the community find out about these events beyond the Glendale Paper? (As part of the grant program, organizations are responsible for their own marketing purposes. Organizations then send the City of Glendale their marketing strategies, which the city, in turn, uses to help market and promote the specific program.) (Asked by Commissioner Anne Marie Chaney)

8. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the Glendale Arts Commission will be held on April 16th, 2024 at 6:00 p.m., in the Vault Conference Room, at the Glendale Civic Center Annex. 5752 W. Glenn Drive, Glendale, Arizona, 85301.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Motioned by Vice Chair James Smith, seconded by Commissioner Paige Hyde to adjourn the Arts Commission meeting at 6:43 PM.

AYE: Chair Nancy Lenox
Vice Chair James Smith
Commissioner Jose Aguinaga
Commissioner Anne Marie Chaney
Commissioner Dalaina Hand
Commissioner Paige Hyde

Passed

The Arts Commission meeting minutes of March 19, 2024 were submitted and approved this 16th day of April, 2024.

Chris Taylor
Recording Secretary