

DRAFT



MINUTES

**LIBRARY ADVISORY BOARD
HEROES REGIONAL PARK LIBRARY
6075 N. 83RD AVENUE
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85303**

**DECEMBER 13, 2023
6:00P.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Kocur called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Diane Kocur, Chair
Gary Johnson, Board Member
Haydee Kukowski, Board Member
Meegan Tosh, Board Member
Theresa Fowler, Board Member

Also Present: Michael Beck, Chief Librarian
Dawn Ferro, Library Administrator
Natalie Menges, Administrative Librarian
Esther Peneff, Administrative Support Specialist

3. CITIZEN COMMENTS

None.

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES - NOVEMBER 8, 2023

Board Member Fowler moved, Board Member Johnson made the second, to approve the November 8, 2023 Library Advisory Board minutes as written. Motion carried 5 – 0.

5. NEW BUSINESS

a. LIBRARY FINES

Mr. Beck gave a presentation regarding valley library systems implementing fines-free initiatives and the feasibility of Glendale libraries following suit. His presentation included information on the following:

- Fines
 - Fines are authorized by City Ordinance (1999)
 - Purview of City Council to establish fines and methods to get library materials back from the public.
 - Amounts adopted by Resolution (2012)
 - \$0.25/day per item (books, audiobooks, music CDs, magazines, and Book Club to-go kits)
 - \$1.00/day per item (DVDs, Blu-rays, video games, Wi-Fi hotspots, mobile office to-go kits, backpacks, and launchpads)
- Terminology
 - Fines:
 - Punitive
 - Monetary assessment for failure to return items on time (per diem)
 - Prohibits patrons from accessing computers, electronic resources, and physical materials (\$10.00 block)
 - Fees:
 - For add-on services
 - Replacement cost for failure to return entirely
 - Meeting room rentals
 - Cost of consumable items (printing, 3D printer supplies, etc.)
- National League of Cities
 - Trying to address the fine and fee structures
 - Cities Addressing Fines and Fees Equitably (CAFEE)
 - National initiative and call to action (2019)
 - Addresses the negative impacts of municipal fines
 - Highlights disproportionate impacts. Wants to ensure people have access to the library's resources, to which fines are a barrier.
 - Challenges cities to champion initiatives that:
 - Strengthen financial security for families
 - Re-imagine debt collection practices
 - Increase access to financial empowerment tools
- American Library Association
 - Resolution on Monetary Fines as a Form of Social Inequity (2019) asserts:
 - Fines present an economic barrier to access
 - Do not serve the core mission of modern libraries
 - Urges libraries to actively move towards elimination
 - Urges governing bodies to fund libraries so they are not dependent on monetary fines as a necessary source of revenue
- Local Systems Without Fines: Maricopa County, Phoenix, Mesa, Scottsdale, Tempe, Chandler, Buckeye
- Budget Analysis
 - General Fund Operating Budgets
 - \$42.6 million – Citywide
 - \$7.6 million – Library
 - Fines & Fees Revenue
 - \$4.8 million – Citywide (estimate)
 - \$17,000 to \$27,000 – Library (estimate)
 - Less than 1% of total Fines & Fees revenue
- Overdue Fines

- 22,059 unique patrons impacted
 - 5,017 are minors (subset of total)
 - \$331,037 total outstanding over seven years (bankruptcy is seven years, so the City has to keep the balance on the books for seven years)
 - \$68,628 total outstanding for minors (subset of total)
 - Actual collections average \$17,000 to \$27,000 per year
- Overdue Fines by Patron Zip Code and Impact of Fines on Lower Income Areas
 - Zip code map and analysis displayed
 - Analysis reveals there is a disproportionate impact to lower-income areas
- Staff Conclusions & Recommendation
 - Conclusions
 - Fines are not needed to supplement the Operating Budget
 - Elimination of fines is not a detriment to the City's financial position
 - Fines unintentionally create a disparate impact on lower income areas
 - Fines present a barrier to access resources
 - Fines negatively impact patron relations
 - Recommendations
 - Amend City Code Section 20-3: The last major update was in 1979.
 - Remove language regarding fines
 - Clean up obsolete language
 - Refresh the Library Advisory Board Powers and Duties to reflect contemporary operations

Mr. Beck presented and explained the proposed policy changes and redlines.

Chair Kocur asked if the due dates for book returns would remain in place. Mr. Beck said there would still be the loan period and there would still be check out periods. He said the initiative would not affect if someone failed return an item. He said overdue notices would still be sent out for materials to be returned. He said the current policy would also remain in place for damaged or lost items.

Board Member Fowler said the change could affect people with a hold on a book. Mr. Beck said staff buys twelve to fifteen copies of best sellers, so there should be enough copies, whereby holds would not be affected. He said staff had different stop gaps and would try to meet demand if it impacted a lot of holds or it became an issue.

Board Member Tosh asked about renewals. Mr. Beck said there were various ways to extend the due date.

Chair Kocur asked if electronic items were kept out longer than books or were more often missing. Mr. Beck said that sometimes happened. He said the collection agency gets involved in both cases. He said if hotspots were not returned, the service would be turned off.

Chair Kocur said the backpacks might more often go missing under this new policy. Mr. Beck said even now, sometimes one or two items in a backpack are missing. He said the items are then replaced and indicated the same would be done under the proposed policy.

Chair Kocur said there should be some sort of campaign to encourage people to bring things back. She said that people still should be responsible, even with this proposed policy change. Mr. Beck said staff would be working on how to do this technically and will be doing a marketing campaign as well.

Ms. Ferro relayed that libraries that have gone fine-free say that they have gotten a slew of materials back upon this policy change. She said under the fines policy, some people are

embarrassed to bring books back, some do not want to come to the library because they have overdue materials, some do not bring the books back because the fines are too high.

Board Member Kukowski moved, Board Member Tosh made the second, to recommend moving forward with the staff's fines-free recommendations. Motion carried 5 – 0.

b. LIBRARY BOARD MEETINGS

Mr. Beck announced that, pursuant to A.R.S. 38.431.01 (H), the public must have access to where the meeting is taking place a minimum of thirty minutes prior to the meeting start time posted on the agenda. He explained the challenges of compliance with the usually location of the Board meeting in the 2nd floor Board room of the Main Library and also the library operating hours on Wednesdays. He said two options the Board could discuss would be to move the date and time of the Board meeting or move the location to meet on the first floor large conference room of the Main Library which has easier after hours public access for the staff to facilitate.

Board discussion was held.

Board Member Tosh asked if the meetings could move to other locations. Mr. Beck said that could be done at the purview of the Board. He said typically a different location was done once a year, but the frequency could be increased at the desire of the Board.

Board Member Tosh moved, Board Member Johnson made the second, to keep the Library Advisory Board monthly meetings on the same day and time, however, to hold the meetings in the first floor large conference room of the Main Library. Motion carried 5 – 0.

c. HEROES LIBRARY TOUR

Ms. Menges conducted a walking tour of the library.

6. CHIEF LIBRARIAN UPDATE

Mr. Beck announced that the City's budget submittal process timeframe has passed. He said the supplementals that he submitted were for the following:

- A request for sun sails at the Heroes Park Library.
- A request for audio-video upgrades, specifically data ports, for the three library branches.

7. BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS

None.

8. NEXT MEETING

The next regular meeting of the Library Advisory Board will be held on January 10, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. at Velma Teague Library located at 7010 N. 58th Avenue, Glendale, Arizona, 85301.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Board Member Johnson moved, Board Member Fowler made the second, to adjourn the meeting at 7:18 p.m. Motion carried 5 – 0.

The Library Advisory Board meeting minutes of December 13, 2023, were submitted and approved on the 10th day of January 2024.

Esther Peneff for Denise Kazmierczak, Accuracy Solutions
Recording Secretary