

DRAFT



MINUTES

**PERSONNEL BOARD
CITY HALL
HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING ROOM
5850 W. GLENDALE AVE.
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**APRIL 20, 2023
6:00 P.M.**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Board Chair Davita Solter called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Davita Solter, Board Chair
Al Lenox, Board Vice Chair
Becky Shady, Board Member
Donna Brown, Board Member

Also Present: Jim Brown, Human Resources Director
Naomi Jackson, Administrator, HR
LeJeune Boone, HR Business Partner

Attendees: Robert Perez, Appellant
Michelle Woytenko, Field Operations Director
Charles Thomas, Field Operations
Patricia Aguayo, Former Field Operations Employee
John Schoenstein, Innovation and Technology
Sheila Reddic, Innovation and Technology
Katie Douglas, Human Resources
Diane Shoemake, Human Resources
Fred Sanchez, Transportation
Ysidro Solima, Human Resources
Sam Garza, Human Resources
Marie Bonell, Human Resources

Lorena Sanchez-Zumph, Human Resources
Vicki Moss, Human Resources
Michael Hamblin, Assistant City Attorney

3. CITIZEN COMMENTS

No citizen comments.

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

The Board approved the Personnel Board Minutes of December 8, 2022.

Motioned by Board Chair Davita Solter, seconded by Board Member Donna Brown

AYE: Board Chair Davita Solter
Board Vice Chair Al Lenox
Board Member Becky Shady
Board Member Donna Brown

Passed

5. PURPOSE OF HEARING

The purpose of this hearing was to take testimony in the matter of the disciplinary appeal requested by former City of Glendale Business Analyst, Robert Perez, regarding his termination of employment.

The Appellant was represented in Propria Persona. Michael Hamblin, Assistant City Attorney, represented the Respondent, City of Glendale.

6. ORDER OF PROOF

The Order of Proof was read by Board Chair Davita Solter.

7. PRESENTATION OF APPEAL TESTIMONY

Michael Hamblin, Assistant City Attorney, gave the City's opening statement, presented the City's case and gave his closing argument.

Robert Perez, the Appellant, gave his opening statement, presented his case and gave his closing argument.

8. DELIBERATIONS

The Personnel Board entered into deliberations on the matter.

9. BOARD VOTE AND DECISION

The Glendale Personnel Board Chair Davita Solter called to entertain discussion and vote on the following four (4) questions:

Question No. 1

Was the action of the Appointing Officer based on political, religious, or racial prejudice?

All Board Members, Solter, Lenox, Shady and Brown voted no--the action of the Appointing Officer was not based on political, religious, or racial prejudice.

Question No. 2

Board Chair Davita Solter called to entertain discussion and called for a vote on item number two (2): Did the City follow its policies and procedures that provide employees with the right to appeal certain disciplinary actions?

Board Members Solter, Lenox, and Shady voted yes--The City did follow its policies and procedures that provide employees with the right to appeal certain disciplinary actions. Board Member Brown questioned the Appellants receipt of the exhibits and voted no.

Question No. 3

Did the Appointing Officer have just cause to take disciplinary action based on the stated violations of the Human Resources Policy?

All members present, Solter, Lenox, Shady and Brown voted yes--The Appointing Officer did have just cause to take disciplinary action based on the stated violations of the Human Resources Policy.

Question No. 4

Does the Board sustain or not sustain the action of the Appointing Officer, based on the facts and information presented to the Board?

All members present, Solter, Lenox, Shady and Brown, voted to sustain the action of the Appointing Officer. The Board agreed the Appointing Officer did have just cause to take disciplinary action based on facts and information presented to the Board.

Board Chair Davita Solter concluded in reliance upon the evidence submitted at this hearing, the Board found the specific reasons presented at this hearing did justify the discipline administered in this matter regarding Mr. Robert Perez and therefore recommended the disciplinary action be sustained.

10. NEXT MEETING

The date and location of the next regular meeting of the Personnel Board is to be determined.

11. ADJOURNMENT

Board Chair Davita Solter adjourned the meeting at 10:10 p.m.

Motioned by Board Member Donna Brown, seconded by Board Vice Chair Al Lenox

AYE: Board Chair Davita Solter

Board Vice Chair Al Lenox
Board Member Becky Shady
Board Member Donna Brown

Passed

The Personnel Board meeting minutes of _____, 20__ were submitted and approved this ____ day of _____, 20__.

Jim Brown
Recording Secretary