

**City of La Villa
Professional Engineering Services
Water/Sewer Improvements Project
Year 27 & 28 (2014 & 2015)
Grading-Ranking Grid**

Criteria	Fulcrum Consulting Services			Quintanilla, Headley and Associates			R. E. Garcia and Associates		
	Grader 1	Grader 2	Grader 3	Grader 1	Grader 2	Grader 3	Grader 1	Grader 2	Grader 3
Professional Qualifications of Project Team	18	20	19	17	20	18	17	13	16
Experience of Project Team/ Ability to Commit Resources	24	25	23	23	23	23	24	21	21
Methodology/ Experience/ Availability of Project Manager	20	20	15	20	20	19	19	20	20
Understanding of Project/Similar Projects	25	23	23	25	20	21	25	21	24
Familiarity with Applicable Rules & Regulations	10	10	10	10	3	10	10	10	10
TOTALS	97	98	90	95	86	91	98	85	91
AVERAGES	285÷3=95%			272÷3=90.67%			271÷3=90.33%		
RATING	1			2			3		

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

<u>Selection Criteria</u>	<u>Points</u>	<u>Score</u>
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	8
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	5
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 18
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	5
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	9
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 24
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	5
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 20
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	5
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	5
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	5
➤ Reference Information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 25
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	5
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 10
Total Score		97

Firm/Participant's Name: Fulcrum Consulting Services

Evaluator: Arnie Amaro Department: City of La Villa

Project Name: City of La Villa - Water Improvement (Elevated Storage Tank) Date: 12-29-16

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

Selection Criteria	Points	Score
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	10
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	5
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Meets All criteria</i>		TOTAL 20
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	5
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	10
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	10
➤		
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Meets All criteria</i>		TOTAL 25
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	5
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Meets All criteria</i>		TOTAL 20
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	5
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	4
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	4
➤ Reference Information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Meets most criteria, but must improve on RFQ responsiveness and information to be gathered</i>		TOTAL 23
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	5
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Meets all criteria</i>		TOTAL 10
Total Score		98

Firm/Participant's Name: Fulcrum Consulting Services

Evaluator: Antonio Barco Department: Urban County Program

Project Name: City of La Villa - Water Improvement (Elevated Storage Tank) Date: 1/4/17

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

Selection Criteria	Points	Score
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	10
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	4
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meets requirements		TOTAL 19
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	5
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	9
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	9
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meets Requirements		TOTAL 23
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	3
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	7
Comments/Rationale For Points: Project Manager has extensive experience. List similar project(s).		TOTAL 15
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	4
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	4
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	5
➤ Reference information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meets Criteria		TOTAL 23
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	5
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: Familiar with governmental regulations/policies		TOTAL 10
Total Score		90

Firm/Participant's Name: Fulcrum Consulting Services

Evaluator:  Department: H.C. Purchasing Dept.

Project Name: La Villa Water Improvement Project Date: 12/22/2016

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

Selection Criteria	Points	Score
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	8
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	4
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 17
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	4
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	9
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 23
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	5
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 20
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	5
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	5
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	5
➤ Reference Information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 25
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	5
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 10
Total Score		95

Firm/Participant's Name: Quintanilla, Headley and Associates

Evaluator: Arnie Angaro Department: City of La Villa

Project Name: City of La Villa - Water Improvement (Elevated Storage Tank) Date: 12-29-16

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

<u>Selection Criteria</u>	<u>Points</u>	<u>Score</u>
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	10
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	5
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Meets all criteria</i>		TOTAL 20
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	5
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	9
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	9
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Must include ADDITIONAL information on project Reporting responsibilities and STAFF</i>		TOTAL 23
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	5
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Meets all criteria</i>		TOTAL 20
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	3
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	5
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	4
➤ Reference Information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Must address appropriate Federal, State, Local regulations information to be gathered and RFQ responsive</i>		TOTAL 20
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	3
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	0
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Must indicate Firm knowledge of governmental regulations and a narrative of applicable rules & regs.</i>		TOTAL 3
Total Score		84

Firm/Participant's Name: Quintanilla, Headley and Associates

Evaluator: ANTONIO BARRA Department: Urban County Program

Project Name: City of La Villa - Water Improvement (Elevated Storage Tank) Date: 1/4/17

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

<u>Selection Criteria</u>	<u>Points</u>	<u>Score</u>
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	10
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	3
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meet Criteria		TOTAL 18
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	4
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	9
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meets criteria		TOTAL 23
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	5
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	9
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meets general criteria.		TOTAL 19
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	4
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	4
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	4
➤ Reference Information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	4
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meets general criteria		TOTAL 21
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	5
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: Familiar with governmental regulations.		TOTAL 10
Total Score		91

Firm/Participant's Name: Quintanilla Headley & Associates

Evaluator: [Signature] Department: H.C. Purchasing Department

Project Name: La Villa Water Improvement Project Date: 12/22/2016

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

<u>Selection Criteria</u>	<u>Points</u>	<u>Score</u>
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	8
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	4
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 17
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	5
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	9
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 24
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	5
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	9
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 19
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	5
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	3
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	5
➤ Reference Information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 25
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	5
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points:		TOTAL 10
Total Score		95

Firm/Participant's Name: R. E. Garcia and Associates

Evaluator: Arnie Amaro Department: City of La Villa

Project Name: City of La Villa - Water Improvement (Elevated Storage Tank) Date: 12-29-16

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

Selection Criteria	Points	Score
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	10
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	3
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	0
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Must provide professional Team Qualifications to perform various types of contracts and an Organizational CHART.</i>		TOTAL 13
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	5
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	8
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	8
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Must identify project composition and reporting experience of engineering STAFF</i>		TOTAL 21
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	5
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Meets all criteria</i>		TOTAL 20
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	3
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	5
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	5
➤ Reference Information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>Must provide more detail on Federal, State & local regs. RFQ responsiveness</i>		TOTAL 21
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	5
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: <i>meets all criteria</i>		TOTAL 10
Total Score		85

Firm/Participant's Name: R. E. Garcia and Associates
 Evaluator: Antonio Garco Department: Urban County Program
 Project Name: City of La Villa - Water Improvement (Elevated Storage Tank) Date: 1/4/17

**EVALUATION CRITERIA
PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES POOL
RFQ No. 2016-002-02-17-YZV**

EXHIBIT "B"

Selection Criteria	Points	Score
1. Professional Qualifications of Project Team (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Registered and licenses to practice in the State of Texas (i.e. certifications/registrations and other pertinent information that demonstrates their qualifications to perform the contract)	10	10
➤ Provides information on proposed professional Team qualifications to perform various types of contracts	5	3
➤ Team members identified in the organizational chart.	5	3
Comments/Rationale For Points: No organization chart provided.		TOTAL 16
2. Experience of Project Team/Ability to Commit Resources (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Designate engineering staff members in an appendix form	5	5
➤ Identifying the project composition, project leadership, reporting responsibilities	10	8
➤ Experience of engineering staff to completely and efficiently perform the work.	10	8
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meets general criteria.		TOTAL 21
3. Methodology/Experience/Availability of Project Manager (20 pts maximum)		
➤ Firm's approach to the methodology and management to the scope of services for the project(s).	5	5
➤ Must be a Professional Engineer registered in the State of Texas and must be included in Appendix	5	5
➤ Project Manager must have five (5) types of projects plus be 85-100 % involvement with technical development of project	10	10
Comments/Rationale For Points: Multiple similar projects identified. Extensive Experience.		TOTAL 20
4. Understanding of Project/Similar Projects (25 pts maximum)		
➤ Demonstrate and understanding of the scope of services	5	5
➤ Address appropriate Federal/ State/ Local regulations and policies. Knowledge and experience of working with multiple entities, counties, cities, etc.	5	5
➤ Identify information to be gathered or obtained/proposed approach to complete the scope	5	5
➤ RFQ responsiveness. Response is clear, well organized, easy to evaluate, and appropriate to this RFQ.	5	4
➤ Reference information including contact persons and telephone numbers.	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: Meets criteria		TOTAL 24
5. Familiarity with Applicable Rules and Regulations (10 pts maximum)		
➤ Indicate passed experience of the proposed Firm knowledge of governmental regulations, appropriate codes, guidelines, professional standards and policies	5	5
➤ Must contain a narrative that outlines applicable regulations, guideline, standards, and policies	5	5
Comments/Rationale For Points: Familiar with governmental regulations.		TOTAL 10
Total Score		91

Firm/Participant's Name: R.E. Garcia & Associates

Evaluator:  Department: H. C. Purchasing Department

Project Name: La Villa Water Improvement Project Date: 12/22/2016