

FINAL RANKINGS - POST INTERVIEW

PROJECT# 2023-009
PROJECT NAME: Classification and Compensation Study

Date: 6/12/2023

VENDOR/FIRM	RANK	MANAGEMENT ADVISORY GROUP	PAYPOINT HR	PUBLIC SECTOR PERSONNEL
Financial Consideration	35		1	2
Proposer's Qualifications, Abilities, and References	30	3	2	1
Quality of Proposed Services	30	3	2	1
Responsiveness of Proposal	5	3	2	1

PSPC has over 25 years of experience in public sector experience. They work with markets of all shapes and sizes including larger markets in Texas like City of Dallas and local markets such as Live Oak. Both their proposal and interview showed demonstrated knowledge in Municipal Class & Comp studies. The previous work completed by PSPC for the City was a positive interaction. PSPC offered expanded options for completing the salary survey along with rationale behind the pros and cons of each option. PSPC has a deep bench in regards to staffing and will be able to provide back-up personnel to complete the project should the need arise. PSPC also offered a more comprehensive approach to the scope of work with scalable options based on the needs of the City.

PSPC offered a firm fixed price as part of their proposal with itemized pricing that would allow COS to remove items that were not going to be included.

PayPoint HR deals in mainly smaller markets, handling mostly smaller suburbs. While the proposed services to be provided appeared good on paper, this firm has a limited staff level of 2 people. PayPoint HR was unresponsive to email communications for over a week and only managed to get their interview scheduled after a final attempt to reach them via phone and voicemail. This leads to concerns that they do not have the capacity or availability to complete the project in a timely manner. The City has had no other prior experience with this firm. Paypoint HR was lower in pricing than PSPC, but their pricing was an estimated total based on a proposed hourly rate and average time to complete a project. It is highly probable that this estimate is on the low side and additional expenses would be incurred based on actual project time and travel.

Management Advisory Group was ranked last in all categories and only came ahead in points based on their pricing proposal. MAG has worked with the City in the past, and the product delivered showed a lack of attention to detail. The provided information and recommendation from that project did not reflect the changing shape of the market, nor did it match up to the data collected by Public Safety areas. The proposed software is something the City received as part of a prior study and is merely an outdated MS Access Database. While MAG was the lowest overall cost, the evaluation team does not feel as though they can provide a quality product that will meet the needs of the City

PROJECT# 2023-009
 PROJECT NAME: CLASSIFICATION AND COMPENSATION STUDY

EVALUATION SUMMARY

Date: _____

INSTRUCTIONS: Enter a number 0 through 4 for each category for each proposer. You may use 0.25 increments if necessary.
 0 = Not Compliant, 1 = Poor, 2 = Fair, 3 = Good, 4 = Excellent

You may NOT enter a number higher than 4.0. An explanation is required for a score of 0

Criteria	Points	MANAGEMENT ADVISORY GROUP	PAYPOINT HR	PUBLIC SECTOR PERSONNEL CONSULTANTS
Financial Consideration	35	\$39,900.00	\$43,800.00	\$60,000.00
		35.00	31.88	23.28
Proposer's Qualifications, Abilities, and References	30	3.13	3.06	3.56
		23.44	22.97	26.72
Quality of Proposed Services	30	3.25	3.44	3.31
		24.38	25.78	24.84
Responsiveness of Proposal	5	3.38	3.19	3.38
		4.22	3.98	4.22
Average Total %	100	87.03	84.62	79.06
Rank		1.00	2.00	3.00

(Lowest Price / Evaluated Price) * Pts for Section

VENDOR	FEE	AD-HOC	TIMELINE FOR COMPLETION	START TIMELINE	
MANAGEMENT ADVISORY GROUP	\$39,900.00	200 P/HR	5 MONTHS	IMMEDIATELY	
PUBLIC SECTOR PERSONNEL CONSULTANTS	\$110,000.00		150 DAYS (7 MONTHS)	AUGUST OR OCTOBER 2023	*PRICE INCLUDES \$20K FOR JOB DESCRIPTIONS AND \$30K FOR DESK AUDITS/JOB INFORMATION INTERVIEWS, COMPARABLE PRICING IS \$110,000 - \$50,000 = \$60,000
PAYPOINT HR	\$55,800.00	\$150 P/HR	16 WKS (4 MONTHS)	IMMEDIATELY	*PRICE INCLUDES 80 HRS FOR JOB DESCRIPTIONS AT \$150 PER HOUR = \$12,000, COMPARABLE PRICING IS \$55,800 - \$12,000 = \$43,800