

PROJECT # 2023-014  
 Project Name: CM@R - Fire Station #4

QUALIFICATIONS  
 EVALUATION SUMMARY

Date: 1/4/2024

**INSTRUCTIONS:** Enter a number 0 through 4 for each category for each proposer. You may use 0.25 increments if necessary.

0 = Not Compliant, 1 = Poor, 2 = Fair, 3 = Good, 4 = Excellent

**You may NOT enter a number higher than 4.0. An explanation is required for a score of 0**

Criteria	Points	BYRNE CONSTRUCTION SERVICES	D. WILSON CONSTRUCTION	KOEHLER COMPANY	MARKSMEN GENERAL CONTRACTORS
Firm's Experience and Staff as a CM@R	15	3.50	2.88	3.31	3.50
		<b>13.13</b>	<b>10.78</b>	<b>12.42</b>	<b>13.13</b>
Firm's Experience with Pre-Construction Estimating Accuracy	20	3.38	3.00	3.44	3.50
		<b>16.88</b>	<b>15.00</b>	<b>17.19</b>	<b>17.50</b>
Firm's Experience on Projects of Similar Size and Scope	40	3.75	2.75	3.69	3.19
		<b>37.50</b>	<b>27.50</b>	<b>36.88</b>	<b>31.88</b>
Project Personnel Experience and Experience with Municipalities	15	3.81	3.13	3.56	3.06
		<b>14.30</b>	<b>11.72</b>	<b>13.36</b>	<b>11.48</b>
Proposed Schedule	10	3.50	2.69	3.50	2.63
		<b>8.75</b>	<b>6.72</b>	<b>8.75</b>	<b>6.56</b>
<b>Average Total %</b>	<b>100</b>	53.05	44.22	51.72	48.67
<b>Rank</b>		1.00	4.00	2.00	3.00

Project: Schertz Fire Station #4  
 Date: 2/1/2024

BID TABULATION								
	General Contractor	Construction Estimate	Pre Construction Services	General Conditions	Contractor Fee	Total Fees based upon 10 Mil Const Costs	Acknowledgement of Addenda	Contract Time
1	Byrne	\$10,000,000.00	\$35,000.00	9.06%	3.20%	\$1,261,000.00	n/a	13.10 Months
2	Marksmen	\$10,000,000.00	\$42,000.00	8.15%	4.00%	\$1,257,000.00		
3	Koehler (GC's Does not Include Bonds or Insurance)	\$10,000,000.00	\$15,000.00	3.80%	3.00%	\$695,000.00		
4						\$0.00		
5						\$0.00		
6						\$0.00		
7						\$0.00		
8						\$0.00		
9						\$0.00		

**City Of Schertz  
Fire Station #4 CMAR Interviews  
February 9, 2024**

Evaluator	Byrne Construction	Marksmen GC	Koehler Company
[REDACTED]	1	2	3
[REDACTED]	2	1	3
[REDACTED]	2	1	3
[REDACTED]	2	1	3
[REDACTED]	1 / 2 (either order)		3
	7	5	12
<b>Overall Ranking</b>	2	1	3

<b>NOTES:</b>	<p>Bryne - well qualified, previous experience with City projects. PM on-site estimated 50% time. Highest price.</p> <p>Marksmen - well qualified, highly regarded references, team cohesion, PM on-site estimated 90%+ time. 2nd highest price.</p> <p>Koehler - Small company, less resources, excellent reputation, past fire station experience not in line with type of product City is seeking, did not include all costs in General conditions.</p>
---------------	--

<b>Award Recommendation:</b>	Marksmen GC
------------------------------	-------------