

**Evaluation of CMAR proposals for Animal Shelter Expansion**

Criteria	Maximum Score Points	Please select a Whole Number from the list provided for each question. (Decimal scoring or unlisted rating scores are not permitted)	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
			Vaughn Construction	Hill & Wilkinson	Spaw Glass	Lee Lewis						
Understanding of Project and Scope of Work	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	9	12	12	6						
Technical and Management Competence as a CMAR with projects of similar size and complexity in central Texas	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	12	9	12	6						
Qualifications of Project Team with CMAR projects	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	12	12	12	9						
History of completing projects on time	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	9	9	9	6						
History of completing projects within budget	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	9	9	9	6						
Qualifications, knowledge and experience with subcontractors in central Texas	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	12	9	12	6						
Quality Assurance Program	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	12	9	9	9						
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>105</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>69</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

Department	Committee Member	Voting Member	Signature	Date
Animal Shelter Board Member (volunteer)	Daron Butler: Chairperson	YES	<i>Daron Butler</i>	11-7-16
Commissioner Precinct 3	Valerie Covey	YES	<i>Valerie Covey</i>	11/7/16
Facilities	Gary Wilson	YES	<i>Gary Wilson</i>	11-7-16
Facilities	Dale Butler	YES	<i>Dale Butler</i>	11-7-16
Facilities	Dwayne Gossett	YES	<i>Dwayne Gossett</i>	11-7-16
Purchasing	Max Bricka	NO	<i>Max Bricka</i>	11/7/16
Purchasing	Teri Jeffries Bangert	NO	<i>Teri Jeffries Bangert</i>	11/7/16

**Committee Recommendation:**  
Decided to interview 3 top companies

Evaluation of Interviews: CMAR proposals for Animal Shelter Expansion: RFQ 1610-114, November 21, 2016

Evaluation of Pricing: CMAR proposals for Animal Shelter Expansion: RFP 1610-115

Criteria	Maximum Score Points	Please select a Whole Number from the list provided for each question. (Decimal scoring or unlisted rating scores are not permitted )	1 Vaughn Construction	2 Hill & Wilkinson	3 Spaw Glass	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
CMAR Experience with similar project and size	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	12	9	12							
Project Manager's Experience	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	9	6	9							
Project Superintendent's Experience	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	12	9	12							
Post Construction / Warranty Assurance	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	9	6	12							
Staff's ability to work this project (on requested timeline; considering prior commitments)	15	15 = Significantly exceeds requirements 12 = Exceeds requirements 9 = Meets all requirements 6 = Marginally meets requirements 1 = Does not meet requirements	9	9	9							
Past Performance with Williamson County	15	15 = Significantly exceeded requirements 12 = Exceeded requirements 9 = Met all requirements OR 9 = No Past Performance 6 = Marginally met requirements 1 = Did not meet requirements	12	9	9							
<b>Total Interview Points</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>63</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>63</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

<b>Pricing Evaluation</b>												
3.1.3--Pre Construction Fee		From Respondent(s)	\$ 20,000	\$ 20,000	\$ 35,000							
3.1.4--Estimated Guaranteed Max. Price		Estimated GMP Per Wilco RFP	\$ 8,500,000	\$ 8,500,000	\$ 8,500,000	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3.1.5--Construction Manager's Fee %		From Respondent(s)	3.45%	3.40%	4.00%							
3.1.5--Est. Construction Mgr. Fee		From Respondent(s)	\$ 283,470	\$ 289,000	\$ 340,000							
3.1.6--Total of Premiums for Required Insurance		From Respondent(s)	\$ 103,275	\$ 89,000	\$ 86,842							
3.1.7--Total Sum of all Fees		From Respondent(s) (check math!)	\$ 406,745	\$ 398,000	\$ 461,842	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
RFP Cost Score	15	Calculated from Lowest Respondent's Total Sum of all Fees / Respondent's Total Sum of all fees x 15 (points)	14.7	15	12.9							
Total Points (Price + Interview)	105	TOTAL	77.70	63.00	75.90	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

Department	Committee Member	Voting Member Yes or No	Signature	Date
Animal Shelter Board Member (volunteer)	Daron Butler: Chairperson	YES		
Commissioner Precinct 3	Valerie Covey	YES	<i>Valerie Covey</i>	12/9/16
Facilities	Gary Wilson	YES	<i>Gary Wilson</i>	12-14-16
Facilities	Dale Butler	YES	<i>Dale Butler</i>	12-14-16
Facilities	Dwayne Gossett	YES	<i>Dwayne Gossett</i>	12-14-16
Purchasing	Max Bricka	NO	Not available on 12/2/16 for pricing evaluation	N/A
Purchasing	Teri Jeffries Bangert	NO	<i>Teri Jeffries Bangert</i>	

Committee Recommendation: