

ATTACHMENT C

FINDINGS FOR SAMUEL CARPENTER COTTAGE (HUNTER) HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT ZONE FILE# 2022-0071

Upon due consideration of the facts presented in this staff report and at the public hearing (March 9, 2023) for Zone File #2022-0071, the Yolo County Historic Preservation Commission finds the following:

(A summary of evidence to support each FINDING is shown in Italics)

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and Guidelines

1. That the proposed Categorical Exemption prepared for the project is the appropriate environmental documentation in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and CEQA Guidelines.

The project has been determined to not have a significant effect on the environment and which shall, therefore be exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) under the Categorical Exemption "15301" Class 1, Existing Facilities.

15301, Class 1: The key consideration for using a Class 1 exemption under CEQA Guidelines Section 15301 is whether the project involves negligible or no expansion of use. The project will result in the demolition of the Samuel Carpenter Cottage, a County Designated Historic Landmark, located on a 20-acre agriculturally zoned parcel. The demolition of the cottage would not result in any expansion of use. The Class 1 exemption allows for the demolition and removal of individual small structures (i.e., one single-family residence) (15301(l)(1)).

The proposed Categorical Exemption is the appropriate level of environmental review pursuant to Article 19, Section 15301 of the CEQA Guidelines (Attachment B).

General Plan

2. That the proposal and requested land use is in conformity with the General Plan.
 - The General Plan Land Use designation for the property is Agriculture.
 - The General Plan includes the Samuel Carpenter Cottage on the County-Recognized Historical Resources in Unincorporated Yolo County (Table CO-6).
 - The project is consistent with the following General Plan policies:
 - I. *Community Character Policy CC-1.2: Preserve and enhance the rural landscape as an important scenic feature of the County.*

- II. *Community Character Policy CC-1.4: Identify and preserve, where possible, landmarks and icons which contribute to the identity and character of the rural areas.*
- III. *Conservation and Open Space Policy CO-4.3: Encourage owners of historic resources to preserve and rehabilitate their properties.*

Zoning Code

- 3. Pursuant to Section 8-11.108 of the County's Historic Landmarks and Historic Districts Ordinance, in reviewing and acting upon each Historic Alteration Permit application, the Commission shall consider:

- a) The recommendations of any local Historical Society or Committee.

The project was routed to the Yolo County Historical Society and the Historical Society of Winters for comment and recommendation. The Historical Society of Winters has provided feedback and comments throughout the application review process and recommends demolition of the Samuel Carpenter Cottage based on their understanding that renovation is not feasible. Two members of the Historical Society of Winters toured the project site on February 18, 2023, to view the cottage and discuss the project and future plans for the site with the applicant. The Historical Society of Winters submitted an email supporting the proposed demolition of the Samuel Carpenter Cottage. The Yolo County Historical Society did not provide comments.

- b) The historical value and significance, or the architectural value and significance, or both, of the designated historic landmark or of the structure within a designated historic district and its relation to the historical value of the surrounding area.

According to the Historical Resources Inventory, the Samuel Carpenter Cottage was built and designed in the characteristic way and is a good intact example of the earliest residences built by the first pioneers to the area. The home was built on a rectangular plan and has a single side-facing gabled roof. The location where the home sits and the outward views to the remaining California Mission Figs and almond orchard planted by the Carpenter brothers over 150 years ago hold historical significance, as well as sentimental value, to the property owners (applicant). The new home would retain these views and would preserve some of the interior materials, as feasible. The home, which is in disrepair and is structurally unsafe, is located in a remote location that is not accessible to the public. The demolition of the home would allow the applicant to retain the building site, preserve the unique setting surrounding the site, and provide for a new home in memory of the cottage.

- c) The relationship of the exterior architectural features of the structure to the rest of the structure itself and to the surrounding area.

Not applicable. The Samuel Carpenter Cottage is proposed for demolition.

- d) The general compatibility of the exterior design, arrangement, texture and material

which is proposed by the applicant.

Not applicable. The Samuel Carpenter Cottage is proposed for demolition.

- e) Plans for structures which have little or no historic value or plans for new construction for their compatibility with surrounding structures.

Not applicable. The Samuel Carpenter Cottage is proposed for demolition.

- f) Conformance with the design review guidelines specified in Section 8-11.105 of this Article.

Not applicable. The Samuel Carpenter Cottage is proposed for demolition.

- g) Conformance with the Yolo County General Plan or applicable area general plan.

The Samuel Carpenter Cottage Historic Alteration Permit is in conformance with the General Plan, and specifically Policies CC-1.2, CC-1.4, and CO-4.3. The applicant intended to preserve and restore the home but was unable due to significant and costly foundation and structural repairs. The location where the home sits and the outward views also hold historical significance, as well as sentimental value. The Carpenter brothers planted California Mission Figs and an almond orchard near the cottage. Four of the fig trees still remain and produce multiple crops each year. The almond trees still produce almonds, though they are not harvested. Demolition of the historic Samuel Carpenter Cottage would allow the applicant to retain the building site, preserve the unique setting surrounding the site, and provide for a new home in memory of the cottage.

- 4. Based on the above considerations and information provided in the staff report, the Commission finds:

- a) The demolition of the structure is not a great loss to the County (Sec. 8-11.110(a))

The home is tucked away on a 20-acre agriculturally zoned property and is not visible from any public right-of-way. The location where the home sits and the outward views to the remaining California Mission Figs and almond orchard planted by the Carpenter brothers over 150 years ago hold historical significance, as well as sentimental value, to the property owners (applicant). The new home would retain these views and would preserve some of the interior materials, as feasible. The building site would be retained for a future home that would be built to recreate some of the design elements of original cottage.

- b) The retention of the structure constitutes a hazard to public safety and the hazard cannot be eliminated by economic means available to the owner. (Sec. 8-11.110(c))

The home has significant foundation and structural damage, that if left unchanged constitutes a hazard to public safety (anyone who may enter the structure). The cost to raise the structure in order to construct a new foundation, in combination with the cost to restore the home, would be financially unviable.